39154

Evaluation of World Bank Assistance for Primary Education in Pakistan

A Country Case Study

Maurice Boissiere
Safiullah Baig
Manisha Modi
Fareeha Zafar

Director-General, Independent Evaluation: Vinod Thomas
Director, Independent Evaluation Group, World Bank: Ajay Chhibber
Manager: Alain Barbu
Task Manager: H. Dean Nielsen

This paper is available upon request from IEG.

2007
The World Bank
Washington, D.C.

ENHANCING DEVELOPMENT EFFECTIVENESS THROUGH EXCELLENCE AND INDEPENDENCE IN EVALUATION

The Independent Evaluation Group is an independent unit within the World Bank Group; it reports directly to the Bank's Board of Executive Directors. IEG assesses what works, and what does not; how a borrower plans to run and maintain a project; and the lasting contribution of the Bank to a country's overall development. The goals of evaluation are to learn from experience, to provide an objective basis for assessing the results of the Bank's work, and to provide accountability in the achievement of its objectives. It also improves Bank work by identifying and disseminating the lessons learned from experience and by framing recommendations drawn from evaluation findings.

ISBN-13: 978-1-60244-078-4
ISBN-10: 1-60244-078-6

Contact:
Knowledge Programs and Evaluation
Capacity Development Group (IEGKE)
e-mail: eline@worldbank.org
Telephone: 202-458-4497
Facsimile: 202-522-3125
http:/www.worldbank.org/ieg

Acronyms/Abbreviations

ADB	Asian Development Bank
CAS	Country Assistance Strategy
DFID	Department for International Development
EMIS	Educational Management Information System
EFA	Education for All
ESW	Economic and Sector Work
EDO	Education District Officer
GTZ	Deutsche Gesellschaft fur Technische Zusammenarbeit
ICR	Implementation Completion Report
IDA	International Development Association
NEAS	National Education Assessment System
NEMIS	National Educational Management Information System
NER	Net Enrollment Rate
NGO	Nongovernmental Organization
NWFP	North West Frontier Province
PIHS	Pakistan Integrated Household Survey
PITE	Provincial Institute of Teacher Education
SAP	Social Action Program
SAPP	Social Action Program Project
SMC	School Management Committee
UNESCO	United Nations Education, Scientific and Cultural Organization
UPE	Universal Primary Education
USAID	United States Agency for International Development

Contents

Preface

From 1990, the year of the World Conference on Education for All (EFA), through mid-2005, the World Bank committed approximately $12.5 billion in support of the expansion and improvement of primary education in developing countries. By the early years of the current century support to primary education was nearly half of the Bank's lending portfolio in education. Sector studies and Bank strategies have emphasized the critical role of primary education --especially the basic knowledge and skills it provides. Expansion and improvement of primary education are often at the center of a country's poverty reduction efforts.

In 2006, the Independent Evaluation Group issued *From Schooling Access to Learning Outcomes: An Unfinished Agenda,* which assessed the development effectiveness of World Bank assistance to improve countries' knowledge and skills base through the provision of quality primary education to all children, especially since 1990. The evaluation drew on many sources of information, including desk reviews of the portfolio of primary education lending and analytic work, in-depth project evaluations and country case studies.

The country case studies assessed the overall cumulative support of the Bank (lending and non-lending) to primary education in the context of historical and concurrent factors that impinged upon and shaped them. In particular, they addressed three questions: (a) What changes have taken place in primary education policies, service delivery and outcomes since 1990? (b) To what extent have Bank efforts (though lending and non-lending channels) contributed to those changes? and (c) To what extent would the changes have taken place in the absence of Bank support?

The four case study countries – Mali, Pakistan, Peru, and Romania -- were selected based on their performance (strong or weak) in improving learning outcomes and their per capita income, from among those countries that had received at least US$100 million in support from the World Bank for primary education. Each case study was undertaken by a team of 4 members, 2 educator-researchers from outside the country and 2 from within. The studies were reviewed both by the headquarters evaluation team and by World Bank project and sector managers for the country.

This case study of Pakistan was based on a three-week mission to Pakistan in March 2005. The evaluation team consisted of Maurice Boissiere, Manisha Modi, Safiullah Baig, and Fareeha Zafar. The team is grateful to the numerous government officials and representatives of nongovernment organizations, who provided insights into the problems of primary education in Pakistan. Given the limited time available, and also for security reasons, the team's field visits were limited to the Islamabad Capital Territory and Karachi, and adjacent areas in Punjab and Sindh provinces. At the World Bank headquarters, the team interviewed staff members who worked on primary education in Pakistan during the 1990s, and reviewed scores of documents.

The team also observed classrooms and interviewed teachers at 16 primary schools in Punjab and Sindh provinces, where it undertook a rapid assessment of the

reading and math skills of a small sample of students. While this clearly was not a full-scale or representative assessment, it provided the team with a clearer understanding of student learning achievement than would have been attained by simply by talking to teachers and observing the school. The team is grateful to the teachers and pupils for their cooperation. The teachers were particularly generous with their time and were both frank and perceptive in their comments.

The team also expresses its gratitude to the World Bank Resident Mission in Islamabad, which facilitated its work and provided valuable information and insights concerning primary education in Pakistan. Finally, it appreciated the cooperation of staff members of other bilateral and international agencies, who took time to meet with the mission team and to offer their perspectives.

Executive Summary

1. This is one of four case studies (Mali, Peru, and Romania being the others) that aims to assess the World Bank's support for primary education. This is a difficult task in a country as large as Pakistan (population about 152 million in 2005) with a complex federal structure of government, a long history that has resulted in a mosaic of ethnic and cultural diversity, and a majority Muslim population. Nonetheless, it is important to attempt this task and to address the major issues in primary education: access, quality, and equity. Although the Bank has been involved in education in Pakistan since 1964, the time frame for this study is from about 1990, the year of the World Conference on Education for All, in Jomtien, Thailand, to March 2005, when the field work for this study was undertaken in Pakistan.

Primary Education in National Context

2. The main story of primary education (grades 1 to 5) in Pakistan since independence from Great Britain in 1947 is that of a struggle to achieve universal primary education (UPE) under severe resource constraints, organization and management problems, and a government structure that hinders good management. Rapid population growth of about 3 percent per annum throughout most of the post-independence period has made it difficult to raise enrollment rates. Only recently is population growth slowing somewhat, to just above 2 percent. Demand side factors also come into play, such as traditional attitudes limiting girls' participation in schooling.

3. A strong role for education was recognized by the founders of independent Pakistan, and UPE was established as a goal at the first National Education Conference in 1947. However, military tensions with India and perceptions of national security needs led to relatively high military expenditures and relatively low education expenditures—an unfortunate spending pattern that still persists. By the beginning of the new century, the proportion of GDP spent on education had not risen as expected, settling at 1.7 percent in 2001–02 compared to 2.1 percent in 1991–92. Spending on primary education as a share of GDP was also at a low 0.8% of GDP in 2000–01 (see Public Expenditure Review 2004).

4. Over the years, the goal of UPE has been repeatedly announced in national conferences and policy papers, but each time shifting the timing further into the future. The goal is now set to be achieved in 2015, in agreement with the education Millennium Development Goals established by the United Nations. So far, the main obstacle to reaching UPE has been political instability. Political instability in the 1950s led to the first military regime of President Ayub Khan, which held power throughout most of the 1960s. The civilian government of Zulfikar Ali Bhutto came to power in the 1970s, after the civil war, resulting in the loss of East Pakistan and the creation of Bangladesh. Prime Minister Bhutto attempted to institute many policy changes under the banner of an Islamic socialist regime, including the nationalization of many private educational institutions.

5. The civilian government of Prime Minister Bhutto was overthrown in 1978 by General Zia ul Haq, who introduced privatization and deregulation policies to counter Bhutto's socialist policies. General Zia also introduced far-reaching changes in education policy, including his version of the Islamization of education. This included the establishment of mosque/maktab primary schools, supporting madrassahs (religious seminaries beyond the primary school level), and revising all subjects to conform with Islam and requiring the teaching of Islamiyat up to grade 14 (the early years of university). The opening of mosque/maktab schools was an attempt to dramatically increase access to primary school by adding regular primary school subjects to traditional religious instruction for young children in the local mosque. The program was eventually abandoned because it was not effective at teaching academic subjects, due in part to local imams not being trained teachers.

6. The regime of General Zia came to an end with his death in a plane crash in 1988, leading to a decade of elected civilian governments. However, many Pakistanis refer to the 1990s as the "lost decade" because of political instability and economic stagnation. There was an alternation of elected civilian governments between Benazir Bhutto (daughter of Zulfikar Ali Bhutto) and Nawaz Sharif, leaders of the two main political parties. Political corruption was also on the rise, especially in the provinces, which affected primary education through processes such as political patronage in the appointment and deployment of teachers. Despite this turmoil, Pakistan, as a participant in the Jomtien Education for All (EFA) Conference in 1990, committed itself to the goal of UPE by the year 2000.

7. A decade of civilian rule came to an end in 1999 with the military government of General Pervez Musharraf, who was Chief of the Army Staff under Prime Minister Sharif. Broad education policy remained the same, and Pakistan participated actively in the EFA follow-up conference in Dakar, Senegal, in April 2000, again signing on to the goal of UPE, this time by the year 2015. The events of September 11, 2001, and the ensuing war on terror proved to be defining events for the government of General Musharraf, and for Pakistani society as a whole. General Musharraf aligned his government with the war against terrorism and also against the Taliban regime of Afghanistan, previously an ally of Pakistan. Partly as a result of this, aid flows have increased dramatically and the economy has shown a marked improvement compared with the stagnation that characterized the 1990s.

World Bank and Other Donor Support

8. The Bank has been active in support for education, financing 27 projects since the first project in 1964 for agricultural education. During the 1960s, the manpower planning approach was dominant within the Bank and with other donors and, during the 1970s, that gave way to a basic needs approach and then to one that stressed a rate of return for education, both of which stressed primary education. Primary education increasingly became the focus of Bank education support in Pakistan. Seventeen education projects and broader operations containing support to support primary have been mounted, with total allocations to primary education of $1,365 million. The component activities of

most projects were similar, and involved teacher training, textbooks, and school construction.

9. Other donors were also active in primary education, including the Asian Development Bank (ADB), the Department for International Development (DFID) of the United Kingdom, and the United States Agency for International Development (USAID). The ADB has been especially active in teacher training. Overall, donor coordination has been reasonable, with the Bank being the largest donor, and thereby having the most influence.

10. A review of Bank support, including economic and sector work and lending operations, shows that the Bank has struggled with the complexities of working in Pakistan, which have been basically of three types. First, the federal structure of the government often resulted in coordination problems between the federal and provincial governments, leading the Bank to mostly fund provincial projects and programs. Second, each province has a unique ethnic and cultural mix, and alignment of political parties. Third, each province has its own implementation problems, resulting in part from the first two factors. Thus the Bank has continually struggled to learn what was the right thing to do and what was the right way to do it.

Summary of Recent Changes in Primary Education

Government policies and capacities

11. Government policy for primary education has always been aimed at UPE, but the target dates shifted constantly. The policy has also aimed at improving educational quality and equity, particularly among girls and the poor. During the 1990s, a number of Bank-supported provincial education projects were mounted to achieve these policy goals, including the Sindh Primary Education Project (1990), the Balochistan Primary Education Project (1993), the North West Frontier Province (NWFP) Project (1995), and the Northern Education Project (1998). However, the big push to reach these policy goals was the first Social Action Program Project (SAPP1; 1994), which took an integrated programmatic approach to rapid improvement in Pakistan's education, health, and poverty indicators. This was followed by a second Social Action Program Project (SAPP2; 1998). Unfortunately, the results of this programmatic approach were disappointing.

12. Many people the mission team interviewed look at the mid-late 1990s as the Social Action Program (SAP) phase of government and Bank cooperation, and the period since 2000 as the post-SAP phase. These two SAP projects are now considered to have been too large (together $450 million in Bank financing, about 60 percent of which were allocated to primary education), too complex, and poorly designed for implementation. Too many donors were involved, and supervision missions were large and unmanageable. Disbursement mechanisms were too complex and placed an unduly large reporting and documentation responsibility upon an educational administration that could barely handle its normal day-to-day responsibilities.

13. The recent Punjab education adjustment credits (2004 and 2005) have simplified financial disbursement to a single tranche of $100 million tied to a substantial matrix of primary education policy reforms. Evidence shows that this approach is working well in Punjab province, where the government is strongly committed and relatively capable, but it remains to be seen whether it can be used effectively in other provinces such as Sindh. A comprehensive new education sector review is planned for Sindh Province, which will presumably provide an assessment of institutional capacity and recommendations about how best to approach the further development of primary education there.

Delivery of education services

14. Despite the many implementation problems that arose during the 1990s, schools were built and public primary enrollment increased at an annualized rate of about 6 percent (10.8 million students in 1990 to 19.5 million students in 2000). Such enrollment growth compares favorably with that in Indonesia during its well-known school construction program in the 1970s and 1980s. However, Pakistan started from such a low base rate (16 percent gross enrollment at the time of independence) and has had such rapid population growth (about 3 percent per year) that the current enrollment in relation to population is still low for a nation of its level of development.

15. Teacher absenteeism has always been a problem in rural areas. Also teachers with questionable qualifications have been often been hired, sometimes as a result of political patronage. Research studies by Warwick and Reimers (1995) documented the poor quality of teacher training and the many primary school teachers who could not perform much better than pupils on grade 5 reading and mathematics tests.

16. The curriculum and textbooks also leave much to be desired. Both promote a rote learning approach and, according to many observers, are oriented towards ideological and religious uniformity, a legacy of General Zia's goal to Islamicize education. This situation is not unique to Pakistan, as Bank research shows (see the Bank's 2005 Education Sector Strategy Update).

17. The two most significant changes in the delivery of primary education are the decentralization of government services and the rising demand for private primary education. The government of General Musharraf introduced an ambitious program of government decentralization in 2001, partly to improve service delivery and partly to circumvent the clash of national political parties. Many people see the recent trend toward private primary as a response to the poor quality of public primary education, though some schools are very low-cost and their quality has not yet been documented. Although many poor families believe their children will receive a better education in private schools, many struggle to pay the fees.

Household demand for education

18. Nearly all research shows that the level of parents' education has a direct effect on the education of their children. However, in the patriarchal household structures of Pakistan there is attenuation of this insofar as many parents prefer to invest in the education of sons only. Nevertheless, many officials now report that the acceptance of

education for girls is growing. If schools lack boundary walls or require a very long walk, the demand for girls' schooling remains low because of parental concerns about the safety of their daughters. In addition, feudal landowners in rural areas still exercise much influence and often do not encourage parents to education their children.

Education outputs and outcomes

19. Trends in output indicators such as enrollment rates are available, but outcome trends, such as learning achievement and employment opportunities of graduates are not. Gross enrollment rates have been somewhat stagnant in recent years (75, 71, and 72 percent in 1995–96, 1998–99, and 2001–02, respectively). These figures come from household surveys, and some observers are puzzled by the data, given that the ambitious SAP projects were expected to have some impact by the new century. Also puzzling is that some measures in the two major household surveys do not agree. The Pakistan Social and Economic Survey (PSES) indicates a gross enrollment rate of 84.3 percent in 2000–01, while the Pakistan Integrated Household Survey (PIHS) indicates 72 percent in 2001–02. However, estimates of net enrollment rates are closer (the PSES shows a net enrollment rate of 48.6 percent and the PIHS shows a net enrollment rate of 42 percent for the same years). The reasons for these differing measurements are not clear.

20. Many education analysts now favor using the primary completion rate (PCR), defined as the ratio of the number of children completing primary education over the number of children of primary school completion age, as an outcome indicator for measuring the success of EFA. While there is no time series for this measure in Pakistan, an estimate for the year 2000–01 shows an overall PCR of 51.3 percent (69.4 percent and 64.6 percent for boys and girls, respectively, in urban areas versus 51.6 percent and 34.8 percent for boys and girls, respectively, in rural areas).

21. A time series for learning achievement over time does not exist, although the National Education Assessment Project (2003) is introducing an assessment system for grades 4 and 8. Pupils are to be tested in four subject areas: reading, mathematics, science, and social studies/Islamiyat.[1] Pakistan does not have a national examination for a certificate of primary school completion, which could provide some insight into this issue. However, tests given in some regions on a one-off basis as a part of various research projects, and other qualitative judgments by informed observers indicate that the trend for learning achievement overall would be flat at best, or probably even declining, for public primary schools. Finally, in terms of labor market and welfare outcomes related to primary education, a few research studies show the wider economic and social benefits to primary education in Pakistan are much the same as in comparable developing countries.

[1] The pilot test results for the grade 4 assessment in math and reading became available in 2006 after the drafting of this study. Preliminary results show a majority of students scoring below the minimum target level of achievement (500 points) in math and reading.

World Bank Contribution

22. The Bank's economic and sector work (ESW) has been an important factor in the education dialogue with the Pakistani government, and in recent years with civil society and nongovernmental organizations (NGOs). As one interviewee explained, this is one of the Bank's strengths and helped the government to focus on policy objectives. Although the last comprehensive sector analysis, covering all levels of education, was the Education Sector Report, in 1988, that report was influential in setting the framework for the provincial primary education projects of the 1990s. Subsequent ESW, although generally of high quality, focused on specific analytical issues, such as girls' education. As a result, there was a noticeable change in the attitudes of government officials to problems and benefits of more education for girls. The Bank also had an effect on the government's decision to monitor learning outcomes after a long period of dialogue, resulting in the mounting of a National Education Assessment Project.

23. Bank-sponsored projects have encountered many difficulties over the past 20 years, perhaps more than the average level of difficulty for Bank primary education projects as a whole. This was especially true for the two large SAP projects—the $200 million SAPP1 in 1994 and the $250 million SAPP2 in 1998 (60 percent of both projects devoted to primary education). Most government and NGO representatives the mission team interviewed expressed the view that these projects were poorly designed and that the Bank and other donors had burdened a system that lacked the capacity to effectively absorb such a large infusion of funds.

24. Investment projects focused specifically on primary education also had a variety of implementation difficulties and delays. Slow disbursement thus became the norm, and the overall disbursement percentage after project completion for primary education projects in Pakistan was 72 percent of the approved amount, compared with the Bank-wide average of 93 percent for IDA–financed primary education projects (see World Bank, 2004c). However, despite these difficulties, without the Bank's persistent efforts to keep access, quality, and equity issues on the agenda, it is likely that even less progress would have been made toward increasing school enrollment, especially for girls and the poor.

Lessons Learned from Bank Assistance to Primary Education

25. Virtually all of the Bank's primary education projects and related ESW supported improvements in quality and student learning, but in practice there was no way of measuring learning outcomes in any of the projects of the 1990s. For example, the Sindh Primary Education Development Program (1990) financed activities and inputs that were believed to be important for improving learning, but it was not until the National Education Assessment System Project (2003) that a system was put in place to monitor learning achievement at the primary school level. In practice, as the mission team learned from some provincial officials that a tradeoff was made between quality improvements and quantitative expansion, and only now are provincial officials turning their attention to quality.

26. There are also lessons about which instruments might best achieve objectives and how decentralization of government can relate to instruments. Large programs such as the SAP projects that try to pump large sums of money through an incompetent and sometimes corrupt bureaucracy cannot work. A careful mixture of specific investment and sector-wide approaches must be considered for the education portfolio. Good specific investment projects can lead to building the capacity that can later be used in a more decentralized approach in the provinces and with the flexibility and speed that can come from a sector-wide approach. Also, the need for intensive training in order for decentralization to work is apparent in Pakistan, as it is in many other countries that have tried it.

27. The need for donor coordination is important, but an important lesson of SAPP1 and SAPP2 is to avoid donor coordination becoming an undue burden on government agencies. While the formation of the Multi-Donor Support Unit for the SAP projects was a positive development, it would have been better if the unit's capacity had been built up to the level required for effective execution of the heavy coordination and management tasks laid upon it.

Conclusions

28. Overall, the effectiveness of Bank support for primary education was only marginally satisfactory during the 1990s. Lessons the Bank learned during the 1990s such as Bank staff gaining a better understanding of problems associated with implementing education projects in Pakistan have led to its support becoming more satisfactory since then. Broad directions to explore include the following:

(a) The Bank should return to a more comprehensive approach to sector work as was outlined in the 1988 Education Sector Report. An analysis of primary education must take account of fiscal interactions and the interrelationships of quality at different levels. It is important to do this in a province-specific way because of large variations in capacity and ethnic/cultural mix across the provinces.

(b) While ESW should be comprehensive, the Bank would do well to focus its lending operations in those areas where it can have the most impact. This must occur in coordination with other donors and with the government taking a lead role, and the Bank must enhance the government's capacity to take this lead role. There should also be a judicious mixture of specific investment projects, such as a follow up to the National Education Assessment Project to assure its sustainability, and sector-wide program approaches, such as the recent series of education development policy operations in Punjab, each being used in appropriate circumstances.

(c) The Bank needs to think carefully about how to engage the government in sensitive topics related to curriculum reform and textbook provision. There is excessive reliance on rote learning to the detriment of genuine cognitive development, and the curriculum contains inappropriate ideological material about religion and other political issues. The recent Education Sector Strategy Update (May 2005) notes that the Bank is

starting to address these issues in various countries, which could provide a starting point for initiating dialogue about these complex and sensitive issues in Pakistan.

(d) Perhaps the most important Bank contribution would be to help Pakistan craft a realistic strategy for achieving EFA with good learning outcomes. Recent Bank reports indicate that Pakistan is far from this goal and not likely to achieve it by 2015. If it turns out that achieving quality EFA by 2015 is unrealistic, then a careful analysis is needed of what is possible, what resources are required, and when it can be achieved.

1. Introduction and Analytic Framework

1.1 The purpose of this case study is to assess the World Bank's support for primary education in Pakistan since 1990 and to improve future support from the Bank. The study will assess access, quality, and equity in primary education, especially for girls and the poor. The outline of the paper follows the terms of reference for all four country studies (Mali, Peru, Pakistan, and Romania).

1.2 Producing a national case study is a complex task in country as large (population estimated to be about 152 million in 2005) and diverse as Pakistan. Although the country is officially an Islamic republic, it is home to significant religious minorities and is far from being ethnically and linguistically homogeneous. Pakistan's history dates to an ancient civilization that thrived in the Indus River valley around the 19th century BCE. The area that today is Pakistan saw the establishment of a succession of kingdoms that were part of the wider history of the subcontinent. Each of these kingdoms added something distinctive to the culture of the area. Islam arrived in Sindh during the 8th century and in the north about the 11th century CE. By the time the British arrived in the mid-19th century, the Mughal Empire was generally in control of the subcontinent, with the extent of its control varying by region. Historians and other scholars note how this long and complex history established a mosaic of ethnic and religious diversity that has survived to this day, even within the overall Islamic heritage of Pakistan. This was further complicated by the arrival of millions of Muslim refugees (referred to as the Mohajirs) from India at the time of independence. These issues are important to keep in mind when assessing Pakistan's efforts to develop a modern system of quality primary education for all.

1.3 This paper is structured to give as much historical and political-economic background as possible within a limited framework (see Annex A for a detailed time line of background events). The chronological benchmarks are derived from major political landmarks such as independence (1947), the Education for All (EFA) conference (1990, in Jomtien, Thailand), and the advent of the most recent military regime in Pakistan under General Musharraf (October 1999). There are also benchmarks for assistance from the Bank and the broader donor community. Sections 2, 3, and 4 address these descriptive background issues and set the stage for an analysis of the Bank's contribution in Sections 5, 6, and 7.

2. Primary Education in Pakistan

2.1 The history of primary education in Pakistan since independence has been a struggle to achieve quality universal primary education (UPE), and to do so amid severe

resource constraints and governance and management problems.[2] The combined effect of these three problems has led to serious inefficiency, and at times outright corruption, in the delivery of quality education services. In addition, rapid population growth of about 3 percent throughout most of the post-independence period has made it even more difficult to raise enrollment rates. Only in the late 1990s has the population growth rate slowed, to just above 2 percent. Demand side factors have also come into play in Pakistan's UPE efforts, such as traditional attitudes limiting girls' participation in school.

2.2 As a consequence of these constraints, Pakistan is still far from UPE. Although the gross enrollment rate began at 15.8 percent (25.7 percent for boys and 4.4 percent for girls) just after independence (1949–50), and it rose to 84.3 percent (90.7 percent for boys and 77.7 percent for girls) in 2001,[3] it is clear that Pakistan still has significant progress to make to attain UPE.

National goals for primary education before and after Education for All (1990)

2.3 Without going into the historical controversies over the partition plan that resulted in the independence (August 14, 1947) of Pakistan and India from British colonial rule, it is important to note how this set the stage for the early education policy that continues to the present. For example, some scholars note that given the early perceptions of its national security situation vis-à-vis India, Pakistan undertook the costs of setting up military structures in a way that many other newly independent nations did not, and that it set a pattern that continues to now—relatively high military spending and relatively low education spending. Other factors, such as a feudal heritage in many rural areas, also play a role in the relatively low financial expenditures on primary education, because the landed elites do not always see it in their interest to support UPE.

2.4 Nonetheless, a strong vision for the role of education, the importance of which the founders of Pakistan clearly recognized even before independence, emerged immediately after independence as a national imperative for the new state. Soon after independence, the 1947 National Education Conference resolved to combine traditional with modern and scientific education, provide free and compulsory primary education within 10 years, and UPE within two decades. The conference representatives took actions that included determining the duration of primary education as 5 years (which was increased to 8 years

---

[2] Governance issues here refer to the larger institutional "rules of the game", whereas management refers to the more detailed allocation decisions made within this larger governance context. For example, the Punjab Education Reform Credit I (World Bank, 2004e) document contains a good background description of *governance* issues, such as extreme centralization of education administration within the provinces, which the credit operation tries to address by supporting the devolution of provincial educational *management* down to the district and school levels, as part of the government's overall devolution strategy.]]

[3] The figures for 1949–50 are cited by Nasir Jalil in P. Hoodbhoy, *Education and the State: Fifty Years of Pakistan* (1997), and refer to East Pakistan prior to the formation of Bangladesh. The figures for 2001 are cited in the "Attaining the Millennium Development Goals in Pakistan," World Bank, Human Development Unit, South Asia (2005). Only gross enrollment rates, which are generally higher than net enrollment rates, were available for 1949–50.

at a later date), reorganizing technical education, encouraging the private sector to open pre-primary schools, and setting up an Advisory Board of Education.

2.5 Pakistan has four provinces: Punjab (population 85 million), Sindh (population 30 million), Balochistan (population 7 million), and the North West Frontier Province (population 18 million). Each province has considerable autonomy within the federation and each has a unique culture, economy, and geography. There are other areas under federal administration: Islamabad Capital Territory, Federally Administered Northern Areas, and Federally Administered Tribal Areas bordering Afghanistan. Azad Jammu and Kashmir (translated as "free" Jammu and Kashmir) has a different self-governing structure that goes back to a dispute that continues even now between India and Pakistan over the status of Kashmir at the time of independence. Within this federal structure, the constitution of Pakistan assigns the four provinces most of the responsibility for education, although the formulation of a curriculum is a federal responsibility. The federal government shares revenue with the provinces according to formulas established by the National Finance Commission, and these provide, in addition to some provincial revenue base, much of the financing for education. The federal Ministry of Education is fairly active and involved in research and national planning, as is the Education Department of the National Planning and Development Commission.

2.6 The first National Plan for Education (1951–57), an outcome of the 1951 Education Conference, recommended the declaration of Urdu as the official language; a revised, diverse curriculum; and the establishment of administrative mechanisms. However, the performance of primary education under the Five-Year Plan (1955–60) was disappointing, with only an additional 400,000 pupils being enrolled, far short of the plan target of 1 million. Implementation suffered from lack of a coherent scheme and uncoordinated changes—problems that continued into next decade and beyond. In the 1960s, under the military regime of Gen. Ayub Khan, progress in primary education mirrored that of the 50s, characterized by ambitious policy proposals, financial gaps, and poor performance.

2.7 After the civil war that resulted in the independence of East Pakistan (now Bangladesh) in 1971, there was a return to civilian government in the 1970s under the charismatic Prime Minister, Zulfikar Ali Bhutto. In the 1970s, the multitude of fundamental education needs began to be more fully addressed both by the government and the World Bank. The New Education Policy in 1972, under an Islamic Socialist regime, announced free universal education up to grade 10, achievement of UPE up to grade 5 for boys by 1979 and girls by 1984, and UPE up to grade 7 for boys by 1982 and for girls by 1987. The education system, however, lacked the capacity to address these increasingly ambitious goals, and instead fell into the previous patterns of inadequate funding and uncoordinated policy implementation, including that involving decentralization. Although the national economy had been growing well since independence, at about 6 percent annual GDP growth, the Bhutto government found itself faced with an economic reversal owing to a bad weather cycle and an international recession in the aftermath of the 1973 oil price rise.

2.8 Another phase of military rule began with the imposition of martial law in 1978, after civil unrest resulted from the charges that the Bhutto government had rigged elections. General Zia ul Haq became president and called on the International Monetary Fund to provide assistance in 1978–79. The economy responded positively to new policy measures, and the country resumed its exemplary 6 percent annual growth rate in GDP. General Zi's regime also had a significant effect on education, particularly in introducing a higher presence of religion in education through measures such as setting up a National Education Council with a representative from the Council of Islamic Ideology, appointing teachers in every school for compulsory teaching of Arabic, establishing mosque/maktab primary schools, supporting madrassahs,[4] revising all subjects in conformity with Islam, and requiring teaching of Islamiyat through grade 14. The opening of mosque/maktab schools was an attempt to dramatically increase primary school access by adding regular primary school subjects onto the traditional religious instruction provided to young children. This practice was later abandoned in favor of establishing regular primary schools because it was found to be ineffective at teaching the basic academic subjects, largely because the local imams were not trained in teaching secular subjects. The 1979 National Education Policy once again set a target of 100 percent primary school enrollment of boys and girls; this time, by 1987 and 1992, respectively.

2.9 During the 1990s, a series of alternating civilian governments followed the death of General Zia in a plane crash, in 1988. Benazir Bhutto, the daughter of Zulfikar Ali Bhutto, was elected in August 1988, and under her government, Pakistan participated in the global EFA conference in Jomtien, Thailand, in 1990. At that time, Pakistan's gross enrollment rate was 54 percent for boys and 30 percent for girls, prompting the country to reaffirm yet again its commitment to the national goal of quality UPE, this time by the year 2000. By the end of the 1980s, economic growth was faltering, leading to increases in poverty, prices of food, unemployment, and income inequalities. However, despite the ensuing economic problems, the effect of Pakistan's participation in the 1990 Education for All conference resulted in positive reforms to Pakistani education policy with regard to primary education.

2.10 The negative economic trends of the 1990s, amid charges and countercharges of government corruption, continued throughout the alternating civilian governments of Benazir Bhutto (1988–90 and 1993–96) and Nawaz Sharif (1990–93 and 1997–99), resulting in many Pakistani observers to refer to the 1990s as "the lost decade."[5] However, a number of significant changes affected primary education. When the government of Nawaz Sharif replaced that of Benazir Bhutto in late 1990s, financial liberalization and denationalization were initiated, which together with the public perception of low-quality education, provided an impetus to the growth of the private

---

[4] In Pakistan, madrassahs are advanced religious schools, similar to seminaries, with a long history dating to medieval times. They have received media attention recently because of their perceived link to terrorism. Unlike the mosque/maktab schools, they are not primary schools, and thus will not be addressed in any detail in this paper. See Bernard Lewis, "The Crisis of Islam" (2003) and A.H. Nayyar, "Madrassah Education—Frozen in Time" (1998), for some historical background.

[5] There were other prime ministers for short periods of time during the 1990s. See Annex A for a more detailed timeline of political, economic, and education events.

sector, including private education. The Eighth Five-Year Plan (1993–98) also highlighted the importance of primary education from the perspective of Islamic social justice and equity. It also underpinned the need for civil service reform with decentralization as a core principle, including community participation for improved social service delivery. Civil society organizations in particular expressed concern about the quality aspects of primary education, while the government was primarily concerned with numbers, including providing access to education for girls.

Recent economic, political, and social developments affecting primary education policies and programs

2.11 In late 1999, for the third time in Pakistan's history, a military government came to power headed by General Pervez Musharraf, who was Chief of the Army Staff under Prime Minister Sharif. Political upheavals notwithstanding, throughout the 1990s, successive governments supported the EFA goals, and there was a series of World Bank–supported primary education projects and adjustment operations that included primary education (see the next section for details). Pakistan participated in the April 2000 Dakar World Education Forum on EFA, and in the September 2000 United Nations Conference on the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs), during which it committed itself to the revised national and international goal of quality EFA by the year 2015.

2.12 The events of September 11, 2001, and the US-led war on terror proved to be defining events for the government of General Pervez Musharraf, and for Pakistani society as a whole. The debate over the role of Islam in Pakistan, which was always present to some extent, resumed with a new intensity. Now the debate was over the teaching of religion in primary education and the role of religious schools, which have been increasing in number, especially since the time of General Zia. General Musharraf aligned his government with the U.S. war against terror and the Taliban regime of Afghanistan, which previously had been an ally of Pakistan. As a result, certain sanctions against Pakistan were lifted and more generous aid was forthcoming. This aid has helped fuel economic growth to back to the earlier rate of about 6 percent during the 2002–05 period.

2.13 In 2002, as a follow-up to the Dakar World Education Forum on EFA and the MDGs, the Bank and other donors started up the Fast Track Initiative (FTI) to help countries having solid EFA plans to achieve quality UPE by 2015. Pakistan is considered to be one of the analytic FTI countries, meaning that it is cooperating with donor agencies on research and analysis on how to achieve the MDG education goals. The key issue for Pakistan as it enters a new phase of greater resources for primary education is to address its management and organization problems and the inadequate structure of institutional incentives. Without such fundamental changes, more money will not translate into commensurate progress in access, quality, and equity. The next two sections will address these issues.

3. World Bank and Other Donor Support for Expanding and Improving Primary Education

3.1 The World Bank has financed 27education projects (or broader projects with significant education content) in Pakistan, the first one in 1964, for agricultural education and training, followed by an engineering education project, in 1970. These first projects took place during a phase of Bank education policy when manpower planning was the dominant approach for the sector. During the 1980s, the Bank supported fewer manpower planning projects, and instead provided general support for primary education based on evidence that the rate of return to primary education was high relative to other levels of education and other sectors in the economy. In keeping with this changed Bank policy and the continuing national goal of UPE, the Bank began lending for series of projects that emphasized primary education, starting with the First Primary Education Project (1979), and continuing into the mid-1990s, with sector-wide and policy-oriented investment programs.

3.2 This case study examines Bank support for projects that were started or completed from around 1990, the time of the EFA conference in Jomtien, Thailand, to the present. The first such project was the Second Primary Education Project (1985), which was completed in 1993. (Tables 3 and 4 in Annex B provide a brief description of the specific Bank-supported investment and adjustment projects related to primary education). During this period there were a total of 17 projects included some amount of financial support to primary education. The component activities of these projects have been similar in most cases, involving teacher training, textbook production and distribution, and school construction and renovation. Most projects also contained components that supported more access to school for girls and community participation. During the 1990s, the Bank sponsored investment projects for primary education in all of the provinces and also in the Federally Administered Northern Areas and Azad Jammu and Kashmir, which provided both financial support and useful experiences that influenced the current Education Sector Reform Program (see Section 6 on Lessons Learned). Ten of the 19 projects originated in the education sector (see Annex B.3) with a combined total commitment of $925 million. Among the 8 that had closed by the time of this study, actual disbursement was only about 72 percent of the committed allocations, suggesting slow or incomplete implementation. Some of the projects were ultimately restructured and credit amounts reduced as part of a restructuring of the social sector portfolio in 1998. Section 5 will discuss these projects from the point of view of their performance and effectiveness.

3.3 In addition to the above educational projects, the Bank and the government joined in the creation of two ambitious projects in support of the government's 1992 Social Action Program, Social Action Program Project 1 (SAPP1) and Social Action Program Project 2, in 1994 and 1998. These projects reflected an impatience on the part of Pakistani government officials with the inflexible nature of conventional sector investment projects and a decision to pump money directly into the reduction of gaps in social indicators (including those in basis education) among girls and the poor. Also

important was the need to promote policy changes on a broader front than would be possible with conventional investment operations. Both SAPPs were large umbrella operations ($450 million total cost for both) covering primary education, health, population, and rural water projects across all provinces. It is now recognized that the design of SAPP1 and 2 was flawed and their results disappointing (see Section 5). What followed in the new century was a series of macroeconomic adjustment projects, some federal and some provincial in scale, that included financial support for primary education as well as policy conditions. Table B.4 in Annex B provides a brief description of those adjustment operations that included education, including the recent series of education development policy credits in Punjab that incorporated lessons learned from SAPP1 and SAPP2. The total amount of lending for education through those programs has been about $370 million. These projects disburse upon fulfillment of conditions (often policy adjustment), in most cases in a single tranche.

3.4 A few themes emerge from Bank-supported projects in the 1990s. The four provincial projects concentrated on improving quality and access for girls. Although outcomes were not systematically measured, much effort was placed on providing inputs for improving learning—namely teacher training, recruitment and deployment, and the production and distribution of textbooks and supplementary reading materials. Community participation was also a stated objective in many projects (see Annex B, Tables B.3 and B.4 for project descriptions), including the two SAPPs, the result being that many school management committees and parent teacher associations took root during this period.

3.5 Bank support for primary education also included sector analytical work. A comprehensive sector report, the Education Sector Strategy Review (1988), examined all levels of the education system and the labor market, setting the stage for the projects of the 1990s, such as the Sindh Primary Education Development Program Project and subsequent, similar projects in Balochistan, North West Frontier Province, and the Federally Administered Northern Areas. However, since that time, economic and sector work (ESW) and analytical advisory activities by the Bank have shifted from comprehensive and strategic reviews to the analysis of specific themes and topics, such as demand for girls' schooling and the devolution of management authority (studied jointly with ADB and DFID). These more specific studies have been important and timely, but there is sense that a new comprehensive and strategic sector review is long overdue.

3.6 Annex B, Table B.2 contains a list of the numerous programs supported by other donors, some large and some small. The United States has offered development aid and advice to Pakistan since the 1950s, when an advisory group from Harvard University provided technical assistance for economic planning. Also, because Pakistan is a member of the Commonwealth, it receives considerable assistance in education from the United Kingdom. During the 1990s, there was also support from the ADB, largely in the field of teacher training.

3.7 The case study mission team met with representatives of a number of the largest and active donors in Pakistan (USAID, DFID, GTZ, ADB, and UNESCO), and the

overall trend is toward improved collaboration. The Multi-Donor Support Unit was established during the SAPP1 period to coordinate donor support. There was some underlying tension expressed about the Bank bringing so much more money to the table than other individual donors, and as a result, having more influence with the government. One source estimates the foreign commitment for education at around $1.44 billion over the period 2002–09, with $650 million coming from the Bank, $339 million from the ADB, and $100 million from USAID.[6] While other donors understood that the sheer volume of the Bank's lending gave it more leverage with the Government of Pakistan, they also believe that this position of influence obligates the Bank to examine its assumptions carefully.

3.8 A review of Bank activities during this time period shows that the Bank has struggled with the complexities of working in Pakistan. First, Pakistan's federal structure is complex. Given that the provinces are responsible for providing and overseeing education according to the constitution, projects managed at the federal level were often not well received or poorly understood at the provincial level. This is why the Bank ultimately chose to support provincial-level projects. Second, the complex drama of federal and provincial politics made for a complicated dialogue regarding "government" ownership and how to strengthen it. Third, each province had its own capacity and implementation problems, resulting in part from the first and second factors. Thus the Bank has continually struggled to learn what was the right thing to do, and what was the right way to do it.

4. Summary of Recent Changes in Primary Education

4.1 This section examines changes in primary education in Pakistan since about 1990. It will set the stage for Section 5, which assesses the World Bank's contribution to primary education since 1990.

Government policies and capacity related to primary education

4.2 Participation in the EFA Conference in Jomtien, Thailand, helped to make Pakistan more aware of how it was lagging behind other countries in its provision of basic education services. The government felt the need to show rapid improvements on social indicators, especially given its relatively high population growth of about 3 percent. Thus, in the early 1990s, the government adopted its Social Action Program (SAP), the aim of achieving rapid improvement on education, health and poverty reduction. The education policy under SAP during the 1990s was quantitative in nature, focusing on increasing numbers of schools, classrooms, and teachers, with the aim of

[6] S. Burki, in the Pakistani newspaper *Dawn* (May 17, 2005), cites these figures from the Ministry of Education in Islamabad.

increasing enrollment rates, especially for girls and the poor. Quality improvement, strongly emphasized in the Bank's 1988 ESW recommendations, was addressed in theory and often taken up in the form of improved inputs, but there was never any serious effort to improve student learning gains. SAP planners chose to put quantitative expansion above qualitative improvement, and there was little resistance from the donor agencies (including the Bank) to this.

4.3 Despite the pledges by the government and pressure by external agencies to reverse the previous trends of spending little money on primary education, actual changes went in a negative instead of positive direction. Over the decade 1991 to 2001 the proportion of the GDP spent on education fell from 2.1 percent to 1.7 percent. And although there was real growth in spending on primary education as a result of the SAP during the 1990s, spending on primary education as a share of GDP remained relatively low, at about 0.8 percent of GDP in 2000/01(World Bank, 2004d).

4.4 After the failures of SAPP1 and SAPP2, the government and the Bank recognized the limited capacities of the provinces to carry out large and complex centrally planned reform programs, and that implementation capacity varied widely by province. This led the country and the Bank to return to a focus on provincially based reform and policy adjustment. The first example of this is the series of policy oriented adjustment credits (2004, 2005 and 2006) projects in Punjab province, the most advanced province in its commitment to reform and implementation capacity. New comprehensive ESW is also being planned by the government and the Bank. A sharper focus on student learning outcomes is now reflected in the government's establishment of a National Educational Assessment System, with Bank financial support (2003). It is now turning out standardized student test scores and examining results and their correlates.

Delivery of education services

4.5 Despite the many implementation problems that arose during projects in the 1990s, schools were built and enrollment increased. As the data in Annex D show, enrollment in primary schools increased from 10.8 million (1990) to 19.5 million (2000), giving an annualized growth rate of about 6.1 percent over the decade.7 Schools in remote villages became more accessible, and boundary walls and appropriate toilet facilities were added in many places to make parents feel more secure about sending their daughters to school. However, there were still many shelterless8 schools in some remote areas, as well as schools missing essential facilities, like boundary walls. For example, data from the Sindh Education Management Information System (2004) listed more than 14,000 shelterless primary schools in the province. Although schools in Punjab are in

[7] This compares favorably with the well-known school construction program in Indonesia, through which primary school enrollment rose from 13.1 million to 26.4 million children from 1974 to 1987 (see Filmer and Lieberman 2002). Indonesia's primary enrollment annual growth rate was thus about 5.5 percent. But gross and net primary enrollment rates did not improve as much in Pakistan as they did in Indonesia. See Section 4D for more discussion of this issue.

[8] Shelterless schools are those where classes are held outdoors, for lack of a suitable school building.

better condition, those in Balochistan and some other areas are more like those in Sindh. The mission visited many schools constructed during the 1990s (called "SAP schools" by many educators and community members) that follow a model of two classrooms, with a covered veranda in between, serving all five grades. Teachers in such schools are responsible for teaching multiple grades, even though few are trained to work in such an environment. The result appears to be that promotion and primary completion rates are directly related to income quintiles (see the tables in Annex D).

4.6 Quality improvement in education has been largely seen as increasing and improving educational inputs. Teacher numbers were increased but there are still problems with placing enough teachers in rural or difficult areas and teacher attendance. Teacher qualifications are often very low, with many teachers scoring marginally higher than their primary school pupils on math and reading tests. Curriculum development and the preparation and distribution of quality textbooks and materials are also still problematic. Warwick and Reimers (1995) and Bank sector studies note that the curriculum for primary schools is formulated as a list of concepts to be presented without adequate attention to how children learn and how they should be taught. Also, textbooks are written with an inappropriate gradation of concepts for young children. Moreover, the content of textbooks and teaching approaches reinforce rote methods commonly employed by teachers and do not promote genuine understanding and learning. The curricula and textbooks also contain much material supporting the state ideology and promoting religious uniformity.9 In addition to having negative effects on social cohesion across ethnic and religious communities, an area to which the Bank has paid increasing attention, an overly ideological curriculum may also hinder the development of basic academic skills and critical thinking.[10]

4.7 The curriculum wing of the federal Ministry of Education prepares the curriculum, and the provincial textbook boards are then responsible for preparing and distributing textbooks to the schools.. Delivery of textbooks has typically been late. However, Punjab Province, under its current set of Bank supported adjustment projects, has shown how textbooks and materials can be effectively distributed through its new systems of warehousing and information management.

---

[9] See A.H. Nayyar and A. Salim, 2002, "The Subtle Subversion: the State of Curricula and Textbooks in Pakistan," Sustainable Development Policy Institute (SDPI). This study points out examples of ethnic and religious intolerance that are found in the curriculum and textbooks. However, this is a sensitive area and most donors have shied away from addressing it directly. This problem is not unique to Pakistan, and the Bank's most recent Education Sector Strategy Update (2005) recommends assessing textbooks and analyzing how they might hinder or promote social cohesion.

[10] The Bank has not formally broached this subject, and, perhaps, there is no need to do so now. When the results of the new national assessment become available, if there is an issue of too little time-on-task in reading and mathematics, then it might be an appropriate time for the Bank to point out international experiences in this regard.

4.8 Decentralization of management was also seen by the government as a contributor to educational quality and relevance. The most significant change to education management over the last decade was the decentralization policy the government undertook in early 2000. The rationale given for decentralization was that it would facilitate people-centered participation, greater accountability, and transparency. This decentralization down to the district level, or "devolution" as it is called in Pakistan, can have far-reaching consequences for the governance and management of the education system.[11]

4.9 As stated in the Local Government Ordinance 2001, and reflected in the Education Sector Reforms Action Plan 2001–2005, the district rather than the province became the operational tier of governance and the focus of all development activity. This is a major switch from Pakistan's inherited administrative setup from the British in 1947, which did had not undergone any major revamping. The ordinance left in place a very centralized provincial administration, with district commissioners and district education officers representing the provincial center at the local level in an almost autocratic manner. Under the newly devolved district setup, the powers of the previous district commissioner have been divided between a district coordinating officer, the administrative head, and the locally elected mayor or *nazim*. There are now also a number of new education district administrators who are now responsible to locally elected officials. At the school level, school management committees (SMCs) are expected to play a key role. However, SMCs, especially in girls' schools, suffer from a lack of information on availability of funds and their utilization, and few citizen community boards have been formed to date. The participation of women in these bodies is limited, owing to their low literacy level, lack of information, and resistance by men. As yet, there is little evidence to show that devolution has made any difference in the education of girls.[12]

4.10 An important aspect of the devolution process has been fiscal decentralization, in which revenues are transferred from provincial to district governments, and special accounts are created. Districts must undertake their own planning, decision-making, and allocation of resources to various sectors and set their own priorities. The result is that social sectors must now negotiate and compete for funds from a one-line budget. In the first round of education sector reform disbursements, the Finance and Planning & Development divisions agreed to transfer funds to provinces as grants-in-aid. Fifty percent of the funds were transferred to provinces/districts with each district receiving between 20 and 30 million rupees. Interviews with financial management staff in the Resident Mission indicate there is a severe lack of financial management capacity in the

---

[11] The authors of the joint sponsored (World Bank, ADB, DFID) devolution study and many other observers suggest that the government also had political motives for decentralizing services. The military government hoped to bypass the established political parties and entrenched interests; by injecting new life into a nonpartisan political process at the local level, it hoped to gain popular legitimacy.

[12] "Fiscal Devolution in Education: Case Study Reflecting Initial Responses," Fareeha Zafar, UNESCO/MOE Islamabad. 2004.

districts, and in many cases provincial financial staff must carry out these tasks for the local districts. It is clear that the training needs for successful decentralization are great.

4.11 Structural factors have also been impeding successful implementation of plans at the district and provincial levels: greater opportunities for misusing resources at the district level; absence of criteria for allocating funds at the school level; arbitrary decision-making; grounds for political maneuvering; and the persistence of tribal, feudal, and biradari (kinship) structures. In locations where feudal landlords still have effective power, the risk of them taking over decentralized structures has been recognized, but it has not yet been fully addressed. It is clear that institutional development efforts are still needed to sort out these structural issues.

4.12 Private and public sector partnerships emerged in the 1990s as a way of improving the delivery or supply side of publicly financed primary education. A number of private NGOs, such as the Sindh Education Foundation and the Society for the Advancement of Education, have been involved in managing and training staff of public primary schools, especially in hard-to-reach rural areas. The self-evaluations conducted by these organizations indicate good preliminary results, and mission team discussions with some of their representatives offer reason to believe in the potential benefits of increasing these private-public partnerships. A recently formed NGO, the Pakistan Centre for Philanthropy, is also trying to involve large corporations, both local and foreign, in improving education delivery. Together with decentralization, these private-public partnerships show the evolution of a varied picture of education delivery that must be carefully studied (see Sections 6 and 7).

Household demand for education

4.13 Nearly all research shows that the level of parents' education has a direct effect on the education of their children. Even a few years of schooling, especially for mothers, influences a parent's decision to send a daughter to school. Pakistani households also consider other factors in sending their children to school, such as income instability at the household level, credit constraints, and the birth order of their children (World Bank, 2001a). Although the government cannot directly control the demand for education, supply side interventions, especially increasing the number of primary schools for girls, can have a substantial effect on improving education in rural areas.

4.14 The inability of poverty-stricken people to bear their children's educational expenses is a major reason for the low levels of education among the poor. According to the PIHS 2001–02, 40 percent of boys and 26 percent of girls never attended school because education was too expensive. Moreover, 36 percent of parents did not allow their daughters to attend school, in contrast to 4 percent of parents who did not allow their sons. The main reason behind this is the very high opportunity cost of education, especially for girls. With more than one-third of the population living below the poverty line, the aspirations, achievements, and performance of poor families, especially their poor women and girls, usually reflect the stereotyped expectations of their families and social-cultural settings. These factors contribute to the higher out-of-school and dropout

rates among girls. Moreover, girls are often seen as a burden or as performers of menial tasks (hauling water or firewood), whose education is not likely to be of immediate benefit to the family. The recently introduced District Education Program in Punjab Province, which provides cash stipends to female students, offers a promising avenue for raising enrollment rates among females.

4.15 A key aspect of patriarchal structures is the social assignment of men as the heads of families. In the absence of other support systems, parents prefer to invest in a son's education, because sons are considered most likely to provide some return on the family's investment. In a study conducted on female teachers' and girls' access to primary schools in rural areas of Pakistan, parents agreed that basic education was important for both boys and girls, but insisted that education of boys must be a priority because their own social security in old age is attached to the earning capacity of their sons.[13] Lack of schools located close to home is another important factor working against girls' attendance, especially for girls whose families do not allow them to attend a school located far from home. According to the PIHS (2002), only 66 percent of villages had a school for girls within 1 kilometer of the village center. Likewise, whereas in 1992–93, only one public school was available for 248 children in the 5- to 14-year age group, in 1999-2000 the number had increased to 264, suggesting a relative decline in the availability of schools.

4.16 Despite a longstanding cultural taboo against coeducation, both the Federal Bureau of Statistics Census and National Education Management Information System data confirm the increase in schools providing coeducation in both urban and rural areas, indicating more social acceptance of coeducation in the lower grades. Cultural taboos against free movement of girls in public appear to be weakening over time and are less of a hurdle in access to education.

4.17 A significant development throughout the 1990s has been the rise in the demand for private primary schools among low- and lower middle-income families. Since colonial times Pakistan has had an elite system of high-cost private education, including that at the primary level. Relatively prosperous families were willing to pay a high price for what was considered to be high quality education. However, with the perception of declining quality in government primary schools, a growing number of families, including many with few resources, have shown a willingness to sacrifice and pay for private primary education provided by a wide range of individuals and non-elitist organizations.[14] The mission team visited a few of these schools, which are easily found in any ordinary neighborhood, even in semirural areas, and they appear to be functioning at a reasonable level of quality.

4.18 After undertaking a survey research of various types of schools, Prof. T. Rahman concluded that a socioeconomic polarization is taking place within education in Pakistan

---

[13] Survey conducted by SAHE in three southern districts of the Punjab, 2004.

[14] A Bank sector report, "Pakistan: Improving Basic Education" (1996), conducted detailed studies and sample surveys that also confirmed that demand for education in Pakistan depends upon quality as well as cost.

(Rahman, 2004). The elite private and military schools cater to the well-off and well-connected, whereas the public and low-cost private schools cater to the poor. The picture of demand for primary education in Pakistan has thus changed considerably in the 1990s and early 2000s, with a variety of household choices emerging. It is important to appreciate this growing diversity and its effect on the formulation of government policy responses to the challenges of attaining UPE.

Primary Education outputs and outcomes

4.19 It order to evaluate progress in improving primary school access and quality, it is essential the obtain and analyze trend data on outputs (i.e., enrollment and completion rates) and outcomes (i.e., learning achievement and related improvements in employment and welfare). In Pakistan, as in most countries, it is easier to obtain data on enrollment rates and their trends over time, so this topic will be examined first.

4.20 After rising slowly over the years, it appears the gross enrollment rate (GER) has declined slightly since the mid-1990s. According to the PIHS, the GER was 75, 71, and 72 percent in 1995–96, 1998–99, and 2001–02, respectively (see Annex D for details). Because school enrollment was reported to have grown at about 6.1 percent in the 1990s, the stagnation in GER could be due in part to rapid population growth and/or inaccurate school enrollment data. The Bank's MDG sector report (World Bank, 2005a) mentions that some observers have suspicions about the PIHS data because they expected the period of the 1990s to show improvements as a result of the initiatives under the SAP and other projects. It is not clear whether the administrative enrollment data or the household survey data are suspect.

4.21 Whereas the PIHS is the only survey with consistent time series data, another household survey, the Pakistan Social and Economic Survey (PSES), shows a significantly higher GER in 2000-01 (84.3 percent compared to the 72 percent from the PIHS). The two surveys present more similar net enrollment ratios: (48.6 percent from the PSES and 42 percent from the PIHS for the same year).[15] There is no indication as to which survey might be more accurate. Because only the PIHS has a consistently measured time series, the sector report used that source for its trend analysis. In any case, given a definition of UPE in terms of net enrollment rate, both surveys indicate that Pakistan is still far from attaining its national goal of UPE.

4.22 Most analysts now prefer the primary completion rate (PCR) to the enrollment ratios as an outcome indicator of success in reaching EFA. The PCR is defined as the ratio of the number of children completing primary education over the number of children of primary school completion age. Although a PCR time series is not available for Pakistan, the MDG sector report (2005) uses the PSES data to construct a proxy for the PCR (see Annex D). For the year 2000–01, the estimated PCR is 51.3 percent overall

[15] The net enrollment ratio is the number of children enrolled from *the official primary school age group* compared to the total population of children in that age group. It is always higher than the gross enrollment ratio, which counts all enrolled children in the numerator, even those over and under the school age.

(69.4 percent and 64.6 percent for boys and girls, respectively, in urban areas; and 51.6 percent and 34.8 percent for boys and girls, respectively, in rural areas). Clearly, rural areas show the biggest gender gap. Punjab Province has the highest PCR, at 52.7 percent, whereas the lowest rate, 33.8 percent, is in Balochistan. As would be expected, there is also variation by consumption quintile, with the highest quintile showing a PCR of 78.3 percent versus 36.0 percent for the lowest.

4.23 Unfortunately, there are no time series data for learning achievement as there are for enrollment rates for the late 1990s, so it is difficult to determine whether the government's quality inputs have led to improved learning outcomes. The NEAS project has just completed its first baseline round of testing for grade 4, and these outcomes show a majority of students scoring below the minimum target level. However, until there is another round of testing it is not possible to document whether learning outcomes are improving. In addition to the NEAS project, the curriculum wing of the Ministry of Education and provincial teams in Departments of Education, in collaboration with UNESCO, have also taken the initiative to monitor improvements in learning achievement among primary school children through the development of sample tests for setting standards. A National Seminar on Learning Achievement was organized on March 12, 2000 to develop an action plan for 2001. A joint South Asian meeting was organized on March 20, 2001, in Islamabad, to share experiences in monitoring learning achievement. Other activities included a provincial study in 2000 to assess learning achievements among primary school children and a review of assessment studies in Pakistan.

4.24 Until the results of these scientific time-series assessments of learning achievement are available, one must rely on the judgment of informed observers who are familiar with primary education in Pakistan. During its field visits and interviews with informed observers, the mission team found no one who thought there had been widespread improvement in learning in public primary schools over the past decade or so. Some observers pointed to particular schools or subsectors of public primary education that could demonstrate improvements in learning achievement; however, virtually all observers believe the trends in learning achievement in public primary schools would be flat at best, but more likely negative.

4.25 Some limited testing data are available to compare learning achievement between public and private primary schools. As part of a sector report, "Pakistan: Improving Basic Education" (1996), the Bank commissioned some studies that included testing selected samples of students in public and private schools in Lahore and the North West Frontier Province. In these two cases, students in even the low-cost private primary schools outperformed their counterparts in public primary schools, with 64 percent of low-cost private primary pupils passing both reading and math tests versus 53 percent of public primary schools. Although these figures may result from student and family background differences, statistical analysis suggests that the better performance of the private primary schools also has to do with better management and incentives in the private schools. Although teachers are paid less on average in private primary schools, their absentee rates are much lower, presumably because they can be more easily dismissed than those in

public primary schools. Annex D (Tables D.9-D.11) contains detailed tables for the costs and testing data from the Lahore and North West Frontier Province samples, and suggest that low-cost private primary schools can be both more efficient and effective than public primary schools, but still place a heavy financial burden on the poorest families.

4.26 The mission team also visited private and public schools to obtain an impression of how the two were performing. The mission team randomly selected 10 public primary schools using master lists provided by the local education management information system units. In addition, the mission team selected 10 private primary schools to visit in relatively low-income areas. While these school visits could not provide time trend information, and they were limited in terms of scientific sampling, the visits did provide a useful impression to flesh out the issues raised in the sector studies and project documents. The private primary schools visited by the team appeared to be functioning just as well, if not better than, the public ones. The original charters of these primary schools are varied, with a few apparently having been started as pure business enterprises, and others having been founded by community-minded individuals.

4.27 In both public and private schools, the mission team tried, as a small scale experiment, to conduct a rapid assessment of reading and mathematics achievement. This rapid assessment involved testing grade 2 students on material from their grade 1 textbooks (see Annex E for the approach we used, and Abadzi et al., 2005) for the general method). The experiment did not show any major differences between public and private school pupils. The mission team did, however, get the impression that pupils in both school types were not very proficient in grade 1 reading and mathematics, even though the timing was near the end of grade 2. Only the NEAS Grade 4 results, which have just been released but not fully analyzed, can reliably reveal student performance outcomes relative to curriculum standards for public and private school pupils.

4.28 Finally, in terms of labor market and welfare outcomes related to education, a few research studies show strong benefits to primary education in Pakistan. Alderman *et al*. (1996) administered cognitive skill tests as part of a large household survey in three provinces (Punjab, Sindh, and North West Frontier Province) and analyzed the relationship between wages in the rural wage labor market and cognitive skills acquired in school. They found that cognitive skills acquired in school, above and beyond years of schooling and innate intelligence, are strong determinants of wages and productivity. Another study of earnings and education in the Pakistan labor market also showed a situation similar to that in other developing countries (see Z. Nasir and H. Nazli 2004). Another research study confirmed the health benefits to a family from the mother having some primary education (see H. Alderman *et al.* 2001). The Bank education sector report (2005) also showed that girls are more likely to be enrolled in school if their mothers had received primary education. Although this research is not as extensive as it is in other countries, the research in Pakistan clearly affirms that the wider economic and social benefits to primary education are much the same as in comparable developing countries.

5. The World Bank Contribution to Changes in Policies, Capacity, Services, and Outcomes

Relevance and efficacy of Bank assistance

5.1 The relevance of Bank assistance will be judged by its contributions to the three areas that underscore the EFA concept—access, quality, and equity. For each area, well-chosen policies, implemented through better capacity and services, should result in measurable improved outcomes. Just about every Bank-supported primary education project had objectives that included some formulation related to access, quality, and equity. Here we examine the evidence for the Bank's contribution to effective policy changes through its sector work and to improved capacity, services, and outcomes through its project and program support.

Policy

5.2 The Bank's ESW and analytical advisory activities over the past 20 years or so have been important factors in the dialogue with the Pakistani government, and in recent years with civil society and NGOs. One person the mission team interviewed, an influential official in a prior government now working for an NGO, observed that this is where the Bank's work was the strongest: namely, helping the government focus on important policy objectives. The last comprehensive ESW paper covering all parts of the education system was the Education Sector Report, in 1988. That report was influential in setting the framework for the provincial primary education projects of the 1990s. Subsequent ESW reports focused on specific analytical issues that were relevant for both policy and implementation. Even if many issues were not sufficiently addressed in projects, the Bank's ESW kept those issues alive in the dialogue.

5.3 The Bank's stress on the importance of education for girls and its analysis of factors constraining female participation were instrumental in helping the government address these issues, not only through external project funding, but also through its own financed projects. This issue was raised in 1979 in the background analysis for early education projects. The human resources chapter in Vol. 2 of the Country Economic Report (1986) discussed this in detail. The last comprehensive Education Sector Report (1988), which set the stage for the lending strategy to Pakistan for the late 1980s and early 1990s (e.g., Sindh Primary Education Program [1990] and Balochistan Primary Education Project [1993]) also highlighted and analyzed this issue in depth. All follow-up projects to the 1988 sector report had some provisions and some components to address lagging female enrollments. Specialized ESW/analytical advisory activities since 1988 to the present also analyzed the topic of female enrollment.

5.4 Today there are noticeable changes in the attitudes of government representatives and households regarding enrollment of girls in primary education. For example, coeducational schools for boys and girls are gaining acceptance. If the schools have adequate boundary walls, separate toilet facilities, and staff parents know and trust, it

appears that parents are increasingly willing to enroll their daughters. The Bank's sector work no doubt helped the government put this on the social agenda.

5.5 The Bank's emphasis on monitoring and evaluation of outcomes has benefited Pakistan's primary education policies. A good example of this can be found in the NEAS project (2003). The concept of a sample-based examination of learning achievement in grades 4 and 8 was resisted at first; some officials saw it as a threat, others misunderstood it and saw it as duplicating the examination system already in use for promotion purposes, whereas others feared negative results that would make the system look bad. Although it is too early to determine whether the NEAS project will be sustainable, it now appears that a policy of monitoring interventions has begun to take hold in Pakistan. There are other examples of better monitoring and evaluation (e.g., the establishment of the PIHS) which can be traced to the support of the Bank and its development agency partners.

5.6 Some educational policy developments have been influenced by recent Bank adjustment loans (recently renamed "policy development lending"), including that found in the Punjab Sector Adjustment Projects. Under these projects, in which funding release is conditioned upon progress on agreed-upon policy changes, a complete reform of teacher employment strategies has taken place. Even in the more poorly performing SAP projects the concept of community participation in education decision making was laid down

Capacity and Services

5.7 Out of 9 completed investment projects from 1985 to the present, six were rated satisfactory by the Bank on outcomes, one moderately satisfactory and two unsatisfactory (see Tables B.5 and B.6, Annex B).[16] On institutional development, only one of the 9 projects received high ratings. Concerning project preparation, all projects were considered to have used analytical work and contextual information effectively and project objectives were considered relevant to the country's or province's needs (starting with the 1987 Punjab Third Primary Education Project most of the investment projects were designed for a single province). Even the recent NEAS project, although national in scope, is organized so that each province has its own assessment organization.

5.8 Even when Bank ratings show satisfactory project outcomes, a careful reading of evaluation reports shows that Bank support was not always effective. For example, a number of project completion reports cite a lack of continuity in supervision staffing, which had a negative effect on project management. While such problems are often unavoidable, Bank management could have handled them better, especially given the challenges and complexities of working in Pakistan, and the high turn over of Pakistani staff.

[16] Project ratings were done through a self-evaluation mechanism called a Implementation Completion Report (ICR) and validated by the Bank's Independent Evaluation Group.

5.9 The two multi-sectoral investment projects, SAPP1 and SAPP2 were particularly disappointing since enrollment rates (especially for rural girls) did not make the quantum leap expected. Some Bank and government officials felt that the SAPP objectives placed too much emphasis on quantitative indicators such as number of schools and amount of money spent, and not enough on the complete package of inputs needed for quality. There were differing points of views from Bank and government officials about crucial design features such as disbursement procedure, but most held the view that the projects were poorly designed. The disbursement procedure required the government to pay for all expenditures upfront and to submit statements of expenditures for reimbursement of eligible expenditures. Although the procedure appeared simple in principle, the sheer volume of many small statements of expenditures and confusion about eligible expenditures burdened the administrative capacity of the government departments. Although lessons were learned, and, in the view of many respondents, awareness of primary education needs was raised, the SAPPs turned out to be very expensive in the end. The good news is that these lessons are being incorporated into a new generation of adjustment (policy development) programs pioneered in Punjab Province and, hopefully, extended to the other provinces when they are ready.

5.10 A number of interviewees, especially within the government, felt that the main flaw in the SAPP1 and SAPP2 credits was their rushing the government to do more than it was capable of doing effectively. In the view of some senior Pakistani officials, the Bank should have been more patient and allowed the government to proceed at its own pace. The critical question is how to determine that pace. At the time SAPP1 was initiated, the government appeared to have ownership. In the early 1990s, it was the government that wanted to increase expenditures quickly to close social service gaps. But the federal government and the provinces may not have been on the same page. One provincial representative said that his province did not even want the project but was pressured into accepting it by the federal government.

5.11 No matter how many high-powered international consultants are made available, a project cannot succeed without sufficient numbers of capable middle-level managers. Many observers felt that top federal and provincial managers were competent, but that execution of the SAPPs faltered at the middle level. This suggests that if the Bank wants to continue with adjustment or policy development forms of lending for education in Pakistan, more attention needs to be paid to deepening and broadening management capacity at both the provincial and district level, especially now with decentralization going ahead full steam.

Outputs/Outcomes

5.12 The magnitude of the Bank's contribution to improved primary school access, quality, and equity is difficult to estimate. All Bank investment projects and adjustment operations had objectives, components, and policies designed to increase access (see Tables B.3 and B.4 in Annex B) and enrollment, an output measure that is often assessed in terms of gross and net enrollment rates. While the change in enrollment rates has been disappointing, there is evidence to suggest that the increase in absolute enrollment can be attributed in significant part to Bank-supported projects and programs. For example,

Bank-supported projects did help provincial governments construct and renovate schools, increase the number of trained teachers and produce more textbooks. Fragmentary data shows 16,000 classrooms being added in Sindh province, the training of 8,600 previously untrained teachers in Balochistan, and the production (but not always timely distribution) of new textbooks in all provinces. Unfortunately, there are no aggregate data to show the magnitude of that support across the entire country.

5.13 If quality of learning can be improved under the rapid expansion of school facilities and enrollment increases (output measures), then completion rates and learning achievement rates (outcome measures) can also rise. Most informed observers believe that changes in learning achievement have been, with a few exceptions, either flat or negative. Nevertheless, the Bank's attempts to keep quality and learning achievement at the top of the practical agenda, as evidenced by discussions of quality inputs in implementation completion reports and the launching of the national educational assessment system, helped to place improved learning outcomes among the government's priorities for primary education.

Efficiency and sustainability of changes supported by the Bank

5.14 Although Bank-supported projects receive high marks for relevance, their implementation was not particularly efficient. One indication of their inefficiency is the slow rate of disbursement. An examination of Table B.3 in Annex B shows that a total of $995 million was approved for 10 investment projects, starting with the second primary education project (1985). Actual disbursement of these funds by project end was only about 79 percent of the approved amounts, among the 9 project completed by 2005. Some portions of loans were canceled when the portfolio was restructured, but the main factor behind the disbursement rate was slow implementation. This does not compare favorably with the overall disbursement rate of 93 percent for IDA-financed projects in the OED primary education portfolio review.

5.15 Adjustment-type loans such as the Structural Adjustment Credit (2001) and the Punjab Education Sector Adjustment Credit 1 (2004) showed better (100 percent) disbursement rates. This is probably because complex procurement procedures did not have to be followed prior to disbursement; once policy conditions had been fulfilled, the credit could be disbursed in one or two large tranches.

5.16 A key issue that recurs in the ICRs and project performance audit reports is the government and other donors were unable to sustain education projects and their innovative features. Sometimes lack of sustainability is due to the attitude of bureaucrats who see activities as being completed and not in need of further recurrent budget support. In the Pakistani government's planning process, either a federal or a provincial ministry must prepare a document known as the PC-1 (Planning Commission's project document number 1) before funds can be budgeted for a program. If the PC-1 does not include provisions to sustain the activities of a project and convert them into recurrent budget items, the project activities are basically not continued. The mission team learned from a

number of informed observers that revising an approved PC-1 is a difficult process that officials generally avoid.

5.17 The mission team also learned that low sustainability may be sometimes be the result of project managers failing to understand their own detailed budgeting procedures, and to thus complete essential paperwork to make the transition from project-mode funding to recurrent-operations funding. This is because project managers are generally professional educators, and are not trained in the arcane accounting and budget procedures the government uses. At other times, it is simply because of budgetary pressures that recurrent funding needed is denied. Thus, for a variety of reasons, sustainability is one of the most commonly flagged issues of concern.

5.18 Overall, Bank projects and ESW were relevant to Pakistan's education and economic needs. The Bank support also helped the government spend its own money more effectively. Without major support from the Bank and other donors during the 1990s, the government would not have achieved as much as it did simply with its own funds and ideas for developing primary education. Also, without Bank support primary education would have received much less visibility, and thus there would have been less social demand for primary education, especially for girls. However, the magnitude of the Bank's contribution to primary school expansion and quality improvement is difficult to document given fragmentary data. Also, since learning outcomes have only recently been systematically measured, it is difficult to know if quality inputs have made a difference in student learning.

6. Lessons Learned from Bank Assistance to Primary Education

Factors contributing to changes in learning outcomes

6.1 Improving the quality of primary education has been one of the major objectives of virtually all Bank projects and ESW, and improving quality either explicitly or implicitly includes improving learning outcomes. Until the recent NEAS project in 2003, there was no system to measure learning outcomes in Pakistan. Instead of measuring learning achievement, the assumption was typically made that learning would improve as a result of greater inputs, as in the Sindh Primary Education Development project. Most knowledgeable observers do not believe there was widespread improvement in student learning in public primary schools (except in specific situations), so the lesson appears to be that more was needed than simply pumping large amounts of money into the system. In Pakistan, management and incentive problems appear to have undermined whatever improvements were made in inputs.

6.2 A recent commentary in a well-known Pakistani newspaper explained how billions of dollars were spent by donor agencies and the government with disheartening

results.[17] The lesson the observer drew is that the program "did not take full cognizance of the fact that the educational bureaucracy was so corrupt, inefficient and dysfunctional that it could not possibly deliver a program of this size." While the ICRs for this project are not as blunt, and not all informed observers would go as far as this, it is clear to most people with whom the mission team met that large expenditures did not translate into improved learning outcomes and other indicators. However, the recent large adjustment credits (2004, 2005, and 2006) granted to Punjab Province may have incorporated those lessons (see Section 6C on Instruments and Ownership).

6.3 Indirect evidence appears to indicate that there has been no increase, and possibly a decline, in learning achievement in government primary schools. New schools, many built with Bank support and through other donor-supported projects, too often did not employ enough teachers, and some new schools were not at all functional. Textbook delivery was often delayed, and many primary school language and mathematics textbooks were criticized for their low quality. For example, concepts were often presented in ways that were inappropriate for primary school grades, without adequate concern for gradual progression in the difficulty of concepts. Textbook writers were typically subject specialists having little knowledge about cognitive development of young children. Added to this is the complex linguistic mosaic of Pakistan; textbooks are written in Urdu, the national language, but in many areas of Pakistan Urdu is not the first language of the students or teachers. The net result is that a complete set of inputs that could positively influence learning often were lacking, or simply not effective

6.4 Even when teachers and texts were available, the quality of teaching was, and to some extent may still be, a problem due to persistent teacher absenteeism. According to many accounts, teachers are poorly trained and underpaid. Despite many pre-service training projects supported by donors (e.g., the Primary Teacher Training Colleges) the government teacher training colleges offer programs that are not relevant to the day-to-day realities that primary school teachers face. For example, Warwick and Reimers (1995) reported that teachers were not being trained in multigrade teaching methods, although many were assigned to multigrade classrooms. There is a widespread opinion that in-service training now needs to be stressed, and provincial governments, such as those of Punjab and Sindh, are turning to private providers to do so. The Government of Punjab, for example, will be relying heavily upon the Aga Kahn University in Sindh to provide in-service training.

Trade-offs between expansion and quality improvement

6.5 Education and planning officials in both Punjab and Sindh provinces told the mission team that their focus in the mid-1990s was on increasing expenditures and improving social indicators. Now, they said, it was time to turn their attention to quality. SAP was an attempt to make big breakthroughs on enrollment indicators, but the management capacity of the system was not sufficient to tend to this goal. The institutional incentives that arise in the Ministry of Education and civil service appear to

[17] "Investing in Education," by Shahid Javed Burki. *Dawn,* May 17, 2005.

have worked at cross purposes. Often state employees including teachers were hired on a political patronage basis by district and provincial political bosses. At other times, budget constraints led to civil service hiring freezes, leading to the hiring of unqualified contract teachers. Thus, despite the efforts of the Bank and other donors to simultaneously achieve both greater access and improved quality, these efforts could not overcome the inertia of a bureaucracy focused on expansion and patronage.

6.6 One indicator of the perceived decline in the quality of public education in the 1990s was that even poor families began to shift their children from government to private primary schools. Recent research shows that families may indeed be correct in their assumption that private primary schools, even the low cost ones, are of higher quality.[18] Moreover, growing numbers of parents appear to believe that government schools are for the poor, and thus are neglected by politicians and officials. Even though private school tuition may be as low as 50 rupees per month, this can place a considerable financial burden on a poor family, one which growing numbers of families are willing to make for a "quality education."

6.7 There is a presumption that teacher absenteeism is less of a problem in private schools, and that belief alone may determine parents' perceptions of private school quality. Unfortunately, it appears no one has collected data on the qualifications of the teaching force in low-cost private schools, although there are indications that their salaries are much less than those of public school teachers. Unfortunately, since the low-cost private schools are not included in the new education assessment system, it is not possible to rigorously examine such private school outcomes and the factors that influence them. It is important that they be included in NEAS in the future.

6.8 All things considered, it appears the public primary school system has expanded, but learning achievement has not improved. At the same time, private primary school enrollment has increased, and private school students appear to have performed better on achievement tests given in Lahore and North West Frontier Project in 1996. In retrospect, it might have been better to slow down school construction to ensure the rest of the elements of the quality input package were in place, as was recommended in the Education Sector Report in 1988. The belief seemed to be that spending and construction had to continue at a rapid pace and that quality could be added later. Pakistan is not the only country to have tried this. It often turns out to be more expensive in the long run to retrofit quality onto a low-quality system after rapid expansion (see the Indonesia study by Filmer and Lieberman, 2002).

Instruments and ownership

6.9 The World Bank lending strategy went through stages, from investment projects (national, provincial, sector and multi-sector) to adjustment projects (national structural

[18] The Bank's sector report, Improving Basic Education (1996), commissioned a special survey that showed pupils in private low-cost primary schools in Lahore and Northwest Frontier Province generally performing better than those in corresponding public schools.

adjustment to provincial sector adjustment). Many informed observers consider the adjustment instruments to be more effective than the investment ones, since they require specific policy changes before funds are released. Few informants considered the early form of investment projects (even those with a specific provincial focus) to have been very effective. Current experience in Punjab province is the relative effectiveness of a sector adjustment project at the provincial level, but such an instrument requires high levels of favorable political conditions and consensus, good dialogue, borrower ownership and commitment to project goals, and institutional capacity, which may not exist in all other provinces.[19]

6.10 A careful analysis of institutional capacity should lead to a judicious mix of project and program support that would vary by conditions that prevail in the provinces and at the federal level. Most people the mission team interviewed in Pakistan expressed the opinion that sector-wide programs are superior to projects. However, this generalization should be resisted and the mix of lending instruments should be designed on the basis of a careful analysis of institutional capacity in each province and of what needs to be done. Even in a province such as Punjab, where policy development approaches seem promising, there is a need for investment project resources, such as those from the NEAS project. In Sindh Province, where many observers believe real commitment to reform and the capacity to execute a large sector adjustment program are lacking, a series of well-chosen investment activities may better fit current conditions.

Conditions under which decentralization is effective

6.11 Decentralization is proceeding at a rapid pace with no sign of turning back. The key question is what conditions are necessary for it to be successful. Most of the interviewees and reports the mission team consulted indicate that training and capacity development are the critical ingredients. For school management committees, real delegation of authority and financial powers are critical. Roles and responsibilities must be clarified so that allocation of responsibilities to the committees, head teachers, and classroom teachers is clear and appropriate.

6.12 The move towards decentralization did not originate with the Bank, nor did the Bank strongly recommend it to the government in the late 90s. If the new military regime had not wanted devolution, it probably would not have started up again, at least when it did. Some observers note how the current attempt is similar to the “Basic Democracies” initiative of the first military government of General Ayub Khan during the early 1960s. The Basic Democracies were to be small units of government at the local level that could bypass established political parties. Historians still debate why the concept did not take root then. The current movement towards decentralization under General Musharraf, coming as it does after the political instability of the 1990s when the national parties seemed more interested in their own financial gains than good governance, may have a

[19] In Punjab, the same political party controls both provincial and district governments, created a harmony and consensus conducive to policy adjustment programs. In Sindh Province, different parties control the provincial and district governments, suggesting much less consensus and readiness for such programs.

greater chance of succeeding, especially as more communities come to the realization that they can and must look after their own welfare.

6.13 Once the government requested help with its devolution plan, the Bank and other donors, bringing to bear their experience from other countries, became very supportive, supplying technical and analytical assistance, and incorporating devolution elements into their projects. In an exemplary way, the Bank-supported Punjab Education Sector Reform program has promoted devolution to the districts via the "Terms of Partnership" agreements between the province and the districts, which has helped to define financial and implementation responsibilities.

Monitoring and evaluation

6.14 A number of Bank projects supported the development of management information systems (MISs) for the federal and provincial levels, but problems and anomalies with data indicate that more work is needed. These MISs are designed to collect school data and to maintain the data in an active, retrievable database. The data are then aggregated at the provincial and national levels. The systems were established under different projects, sometimes supported by technical assistance from bilateral donors, and are more or less functional, despite some problems in quality. The systems in Punjab and Sindh provinces are considered to function the best, although data from Punjab are somewhat out of date, and the system in Sindh, which was established in the early 1990s, is less technologically advanced. Nevertheless, Sindh has begun innovative use of a geographic positioning system in school location and planning, which is being adopted by other planning agencies in the province.

6.15 The Bank is also supporting the ongoing NEAS project (2003) to establish a periodical sample-based assessment focused on the content in the national curriculum. Standardized tests are being administered to samples of grade 4 and grade 8 students in language, mathematics, science, and social studies/life skills/Islamiyat. Prior to this and since 1983 there had been 10 such learning assessments, but no attempt had been made to link one to another (in a time series) and they were often not national in scope.

Donor coordination

6.16 There has generally been good cooperation between the Bank and other donors. Government officials generally expressed positive opinions about the role of donors and did not see big coordination problems. But when pressed about specific issues such as the large SAPP credits, officials said the projects were too large, and the number of donors and their extraordinarily large supervision missions sometimes overwhelmed government counterparts. Government officials say the formation of the Multi-Donor Support Unit, initiated to provide assistance to SAP was useful but still did not solve all of the problems. The lesson learned is that such a large-scale venture is counterproductive and should not be repeated.

6.17 The recent Punjab project credits incorporated the lessons learned from the SAP weaknesses. ADB and the Bank are playing complementary (appropriate and coordinated) roles in providing support in that project. Also, donors are collaborating at the district level in capacity building initiatives, which is necessary for successful devolution. Among the multilateral donors, the Bank and ADB are taking major roles, and among bilateral donors, DFID and USAID are major supporters. USAID is taking a greater role in Sindh Province with its Education Sector Reform Assistance, which incorporates innovative features such as school grants that have become a feature of many Bank-supported projects in other countries. The coordination between the Resident Mission and USAID on this has been good.

7. Conclusions

7.1 Before offering a few conclusions about how the World Bank can improve its support for primary education in Pakistan, it is useful to consider a few simple questions that put the problems in perspective. The mission team asked a number of Pakistani interviewees the following questions:

- What is so difficult about building appropriate schools?
- What is so difficult about providing decently trained teachers?
- What is so difficult about supplying adequate textbooks?
-

The answers varied, but most did not have to do with complicated technical considerations; instead, they focused on inadequate spending, organization problems, and inadequate incentives.

7.2 Another way of posing this is in the form of a puzzle posed by Prof. P. Hoodbhoy in his book on education in Pakistan for the 50th anniversary of independence[20]: Why do other institutions in Pakstani society (the military, military schools, railways, electricity authority, etc.) function, albeit not perfectly, while the public education system does not function? The answer is partly one of resources, but also one of organization and public sector incentives to carry out basic functions and to deliver basic goods and services. For example, Warwick and Reimers (1995) in their book on primary education in Pakistan cite their interviews with officials responsible for military schools, which by most accounts, function at a reasonable level. These institutions apparently have a management that offers incentives to teachers and administrators for effectively performing their basic missions. Consequently, their employees are present at work, they receive adequate training, and top managers are not subject to negative political interference as they so often are in public primary education.

[20] See “Education and the State: Fifty Years of Pakistan” edited by Pervez Hoodbhoy (1997).

7.3 These simple questions quickly lead to more complex and detailed questions, because the education enterprise is not as simple as outsiders might think. For example, one knowledgeable interviewee stated that weaknesses in the education system largely reflect management problems not educational ones. All of this must be kept in mind in thinking through how the Bank can help.

Recent changes in primary education outputs and outcomes

7.4 It is clear that over time more schools have been built and enrollment has risen, in part due to Bank contributions. However, not enough has been done to systematically to improve learning outcomes, despite strong evidence of weaknesses and recommendations for improvement dating back to the late 1980s. It is not that educational quality has been ignored: the have been countless attempts to improve facilities, books, teaching, and community support, but without any repeated measures of outcomes it has not been possible to determine if such interventions have made a difference; likewise, there has been no attempt to make schools and educational authorities accountable for learning outcomes.

7.5 The opinion of virtually all informed observers with whom the mission team met is that average learning achievement is not rising in government primary schools, and more than likely it is falling as rapid expansion in enrollment occurs. A few observers ventured that learning achievement might be flat, but the vast majority expected that it would show a decline if proper assessments had occurred. The mission team could not find a single individual who would argue that learning quality in government primary schools had been maintained or increased over the past 10 to 15 years. The main reason given for declining learning trends is shortage of inputs that research has shown to be positively related to learning—time on task on academic subjects, teacher attendance, new schools built and staffed, an adequate supply of quality teachers and textbooks, and effective management and management incentives.

7.6 There are some examples of government primary schools where things have improved, and these should be examined more closely for lessons that could be relevant to other schools in Pakistan. In some cases, these schools are run as model schools by NGOs, which make sure that in-service teacher training occurs and that basic inputs are available. Opinions varied about the quality of learning in the low-cost private primary schools. As the Bank's 1996 sector report points out low-cost private primary schools in Punjab were outperforming government primary schools, but at a relatively high cost to parents. It would be good if the NEAS project could expand its sampling frame to include such school, since it would surely provide valuable information.

Development effectiveness of Bank support

7.7 Overall, the development effectiveness of Bank support was only marginally satisfactory from the late 1980s up to the end of the SAPP period in the late 1990s (see paragraphs 61 and 62) . Since the late 1990s and into the early 2000s, the effectiveness of Bank support has improved as the Bank learned what worked and what did not in those

earlier operations and has gained a better understanding of the difficult implementation environment in Pakistan.

Improving the effectiveness of future Bank support

7.8 The Bank's analytical work was generally good, although at times it was allowed to grow out of date and become less comprehensive in scope in favor of focusing on specific issues. The last comprehensive ESW report was completed in late 1988, which set the stage for operations in the early and mid-1990s. Many of the issues raised in the 1988 sector report are still very much alive and need to be addressed. For example, the report recommended that quality must not be neglected, even if it meant slowing down the pace of school construction. On balance, this recommendation should have been followed and would have resulted in more effective expenditures that produced better learning results.

7.9 The Bank could improve the effectiveness of ESW by returning to a more comprehensive approach to sector work that would cover all levels of education and their interactions. Examining the interactions among the levels of education is important because the quality of secondary education affects the quality of teachers at the primary level, and poor-quality primary education leads to poor-quality secondary education. Institutional capacity and incentives in the education system and its interface with the labor market should also be part of a comprehensive approach to ESW. Given the complexities of the federal system in Pakistan and the wide variations across provinces, the comprehensive ESW should be done mainly at the province level.

7.10 Additional cost and scheduling implications of a more comprehensive approach must be considered, because there will always be some pressure on Bank operational budgets, and ESW may suffer in a tough budgetary environment. Nonetheless, the benefits of the comprehensive approach to ESW in Pakistan seem high. The Bank could take a more innovative approach to this, such as multi-donor collaboration and involving provincial government staff, local academics, and NGOs. This could help keep costs down and probably result in a better product.

7.11 A significant part of future ESW should be devoted to assessing the quality and accuracy of education data at the federal and provincial levels. The mission team encountered inconsistencies in basic administrative data just in selecting and locating a small sample of schools to visit. Other researchers and reports have also pointed out these inconsistencies. For policymakers to feel confident about their diagnoses of problems, they must also have confidence in the underlying data.

7.12 While ESW should become more comprehensive, the Bank would do well to focus its primary education operations on those areas and instruments where it can make the best contribution. This would be in keeping with the Comprehensive Development Framework in which the analysis is comprehensive but the lending operations are focused, leaving some areas to other donors and the government (see World Bank, 2003d). This requires even more coordination with other donors under the government's

leadership. (It is hoped that more leadership in donor coordination will come from the provincial governments). The Bank may be in a comparatively good position to guide the country on its new student learning assessment program, helping to assure that it makes its way into the mainstream as an ongoing operation at both federal and provincial levels after the initial NEAS project is completed.

7.13 The Bank needs to think carefully about how to engage the federal and provincial governments on sensitive topics related to curriculum reform and textbook writing. These efforts must include focus on the cognitive domain, which currently relies too on rote pedagogy, and the social domain, which is now dominated by political, religious, and ideological material, posing a threat to social cohesion. These deficiencies may not only harm the cognitive and personal development of pupils, they may also lay the foundation for future political problems. As a first step, some Pakistani educators suggested an indirect approach,

7.14 Perhaps the most important as an area for future Bank support is serious government planning and programming for reaching MDGs and goals of the EFA follow-up conference in Dakar, in 2000. This should include not only access and equity targets, but also true gains in learning at the primary level. Given how far away Pakistan is at present from quality UPE, the most recent sector report on the MDGs (2005) concludes that it is very unlikely that Pakistan will achieve the education MDGs. The report by Bruns *et al.* (2003) on the education MDGs came to similar conclusions about Pakistan, using a very different simulation methodology. The federal and provincial governments should, in cooperation with the Bank and other donors, analyze and develop a realistic strategy and action plan for achieving the goals of access, quality, and equity that embody the education MDGs and the goals of the Dakar 2000 EFA follow-up conference. If it turns out that 2015 is not a realistic target for some provinces, but 2025 is, the analysis should be honest, and point out in specific terms the resources and actions required.

Bibliography

Abadzi, Helen, L. Crouch, M. Echegaray, C. Pasco, and J. Samp. 2005. "Monitoring Basic Skills Acquisition through Rapid Learning Assessments: A Case Study from Peru." *Prospects*, vol. 25, no. 2.

Alderman, H., J. Behrman, V. Lavy and R. Menon. 2001. "Child Health and School Enrollment: A Longitudinal Analysis." *Journal of Human Resources*.

Alderman, H.; J. Behrman, D. Ross, and R. Sabot. 1996. "The Returns to Endogenous Human Capital in Pakistan's Rural Wage Labor Market." *Oxford Bulletin of Economics and Statistics*.

Asian Development Bank, DFID. 2004. "Devolution in Pakistan: An Assessment and Recommendation for Action" Vols. 1 and 2, Washington, D.C.

Bennett Jones, Owen. 2003. *Pakistan: Eye of the Storm*. Yale University Press.

Bruns, Barbara, A. Mingat, R. Rakotomalala. 2003. *A Change for Every Child: Achieving Universal Primary Education by 2015.* Washington, D.C.: The World Bank.

Burki, Shahid Javed. 1999. *Pakistan: Fifty Years of Nationhood,* 3rd ed. Westview Press.

Filmer, Deon and Samuel Lieberman. 2002. "Indonesia and EFA." World Bank EFA Case Study.

Hoodbhoy, Pervez (ed.). 1998. *Education and the State: Fifty Years of Pakistan.* Oxford University Press.

Kardar, Shahid. 1998. "The Economics of Education." In *Education and the State: Fifty Years of Pakistan* (P. Hoodbhoy, ed.). Oxford University Press.

Lewis, Bernard. 2003. "The Crisis of Islam." Random House.

Nasir, Z. and H. Nazli. 2004. "Earnings and Education in Pakistan." Pakistan Institute of Development Economics.

Nayyar, A.H. 1998. "Madrassah Education – Frozen in Time." In *Education and the State: Fifty Years of Pakistan* (P. Hoodbhoy, ed.). Oxford University Press.

Nayyar, A.H. and Ahmed Salim (eds.). 2002. *The Subtle Subversion: the State of Curricula and Textbooks in Pakistan.* Islamabad: Sustainable Development Policy Institute.

Rahman, Tariq. 2004. *Denizens of Alien Worlds: A Study of Education, Inequality and Polarization in Pakistan*. Oxford University Press.

State Bank of Pakistan Report, 2004.

UNESCO. 2000. World Education Report. Paris.

Warwick, Donald and Fernando Reimers. 1995. *Hope or Despair: Learning in Pakistan's Primary Schools*. Praeger Publishers.

World Bank. 1986. Economic and Social Development Prospects: Pakistan. Vol. 2. Washington, D.C.

_____. 1997. Implementation Completion Report. Third Primary Education Project: Punjab. (1987).

———. 1988. Education Sector Strategy Review. Vol. 1., Washington, D.C.

———. 1990. Three Education Projects, Washington, D.C.

———. 1996. Improving Basic Education, Washington, D.C.

———. 1998. Social Action Program Project I, Washington, D.C.

———. 2000a. Implementation Completion Report. Balochistan Primary Education Project (1993), Washington, D.C.

———. 2000b. Implementation Completion Report. Sindh Primary Education Development Program (1990), Washington, D.C.

———. 2000c. Project Performance Audit Report. Third Primary Education Project: Punjab, Washington, D.C.

———. 2001a. Household Schooling Decisions in Rural Pakistan, Poverty Research Working Paper 2541, Washington, D.C.

———. 2001b. Implementation Completion Report. Punjab Middle School Project (1992), Washington, D.C.

———. 2002a. Implementation Completion Report. Northwest Frontier Province Primary Education Program (1995), Washington, D.C.

———. 2002b. Implementation Completion Report. SAC National, Washington, D.C.

———. 2002c. Implementation Completion Report. Social Action Program Project II, Washington, D.C.

———. 2002d. SAC1 NWFP, Washington, D.C.

———. 2003a. Implementation Completion Report. Northern Education Project (1997), Washington, D.C.

———. 2003b. Implementation Completion Report. SAC Sindh, Washington, D.C..

———. 2003c. Management Response: Toward Country-Led Development: Multiple Partners Evaluation of the Comprehensive Development Framework, Washington, D.C.

———. 2003d. Toward Country-Led Development: Multiple Partners Evaluation of the Comprehensive Development Framework, Washington, D.C.

———. 2004a. PD.PRSC, Washington, D.C.

———. 2004b. PD.SAC2 NWFP, Washington, D.C.

_____. 2004c. Primary Education Portfolio Review, Independent Evaluation Group (formerly OED), Washington, D.C.

———. 2004d. Public Expenditure Review. Vol. 1, Washington, D.C.

_____. 2004e. Punjab Education Reform Credit I, PAD, Washington, D.C.

———. 2005a. Attaining the Millennium Development Goals in Pakistan, Washington, D.C.

_____. 2005b. Education sector strategy update : achieving education for all, broadening our perspective, maximizing our effectiveness, Washington, D.C.

Zafar, Fareeha. 2003. “Fiscal Devolution in Education: Case Study Reflecting Initial Responses.” UNESCO/MOE-Pakistan.

Ziring, Lawrence.1997. *Pakistan in the Twentieth Century: A Political History*. Oxford University Press.

Annex A. Timeline of Events and Development Assistance

Year	National Event	Regional/Provincial Event	Primary Education Development	Bi/Multilateral Agency Event	World Bank Event
1947	Pakistan emerges as a sovereign state with an interim constitution. National Education Conference 1948: Jinnah dies	Education was the responsibility of Local Bodies	Free and compulsory primary education within 10 years & UPE within two decades		Bretton Woods Agreement operationalized in 1946 creating IBRD (WB) and IMF.
1950					Pakistan joins World Bank and IMF
1951	Assassination of country's first PM. Politicization of bureaucracy National Education Conference 1951-57. National Plan for education is not implemented	Elections in Punjab for the first time	Female teachers proposed for primary education		Development models for LDCs: Growth models based upon capital accumulation. [21]
1952	1952-58 Six Year National Plan for Educational Development : Division for Education set up in the Planning Commission		Set goal of UPE within 15 years	Colombo Plan is first donor supported attempt at planning for Pakistan.	
1953	Pakistan declared Islamic Republic Several changes of government Politicization of bureaucracy	Punjab under military rule following riots against Ahmadis			
1954	State of emergency declared			Mutual Defense Assistance agreement with US	
1955	Merger of provinces in West	Education becomes a provincial subject			

[21] This remark and the others that follow about economic growth models are from Akbar Zaidi (2001), Issues in Pakistan's Economy. They reflect his view of general academic and international community consensus.

	Pakistan: One Unit Scheme Pakistan joins SEATO. First FYP 1955-60. Mid 1950s: Involvement of Harvard Advisory Group (HAG) and American Aid. Afterwards strengthening of Planning Commission of Pakistan with the assistance of Ford Foundation. Devaluation of Currency in 1956. 1955-56: Reviving agriculture production through subsidization of fertilizers and expansion of irrigation facilities. .				
1956	First constitution Several changes of government				
1958	Martial Law imposed Land Reforms in 1959 1959:Commission on National Education 1962: New Constitution with extensive powers to President Introduced trickle down marked-based economic philosophy. Trickle down came-up with increasing jobs and higher wages		1960s: less focus on primary education	1961: Joint Communique for cooperation between US and Pakistan 1963: Aid to Pakistan Consortium endorses aid package of US$500 million	Economic models for LDCs: Trickle down and functional inequality First loan asked from IMF
1960			Karachi Plan: aimed broadly at achieving UPE in the region by 1980	UN (1960): Convention Against Discrimination in Education UNESCO: Conference of States in Karachi 1960	
1963	Capital shifts to	Islamabad Capital			

	Islamabad	Territory (ICT) created			
1964				Start of IDA credit	First Education Project for Agricultural Education.
1965	Presidential elections under 1962 Constitution War with India	Basic Democracies system introduced to create an electoral college		Delay in aid commitments conveyed by US	Loan asked for from IMF
1967	Issue of autonomy of federating provinces	Six point programme of Mujibur Rahman in East Pakistan		ADB started operating in Pakistan in 1968	
1969	Declaration of Martial Law 1970: Elections				
1971	Separation of Bangladesh Bhutto President of Pakistan			UN: International Commission on the Development of Education	Economic models for LDCs: Basic Needs & Redistribution with growth
1972	Nationalization of educational institutions with few exceptions Land Reforms & nationalization of other sectors including banks and industries Devaluation leading to high inflation		Prim.Educ. seen as responsibility of the State Policy of expansion of education to deprived sections and increased accessibility Education to be free and universal up to class X Achieve UPE up to class V for boys by 1979 and girls 1984 UPE up to class VIII for bys by 1982 and girls by 1987		
1973	New Constitution Oil price rise economic shock		'the state shall '*remove illiteracy and provide free and compulsory secondary education within minimum possible period'* (Article 37-B, Constitution of Pakistan, 1973).	UNESCO Report: *Learning to Be: The World of Education Today and Tomorrow* (Non-formal Education alternatives)	
1975	Economic reversal owing to adverse weather		Non-formal education aimed at providing	US lifts arms embargo on Pakistan	Shift in thinking and lending for

	cycle and international recession The political consensus under the 1973 Constitution suffered a shock with the left oriented insurgency in Balochistan province and a national coalition of right wing political forces against land reforms and nationalization of other sectors including banks and industries.		primary school certificate by NGOs		education
1977	Government's attempts at elections failed due to rigging charges with imposition of Martial Law in 1978. Ziaul Haq becomes President calls in IMF for assistance 1979: Bhutto is hanged		Focus on basic education – low literacy, 50% wastage rates in primary. Focus on girls in rural areas	USAID Prim. Education Project dropped after reduction in US assistance	
1979					First Prim.Educ.(or Fourth Educ.) Project based upon project prepared by USAID/GOP but dropped.
1980	Denationalization, investment in industry and privatization 1979 National Education Policy: Islamization of education		Total primary school enrollment of boys by 1987 and girls by 1992 Support to mosque/maktab schools Denationalization of schools Support to private sector		Model of economic liberalization. Start of IMF and WB Structural Adjustment Programmes by WB in Pakistan.
1982		Start of the AKRSP in the Northern Areas	Enhancing quality of primary teacher training. TTIs elevated to		

			college status		
1983-84	6th Five Year Plan Deregularization & Liberalization 1982: Rupee floating currency linked to US$ High rate of remittances from Middle East reflected in high economic growth rate	LCs established under USAID-AED project	Primary education gets largest share of resources for the first time		
1985	Elections without political parties. Prime Minister Junejo 5 point program again includes plan for UPE.	Separate Punjab provincial primary education project	1985 Second Primary Education Project Non-formal education for achieving PE: Nai Roshni scheme		Intensive adjustment lending by WB 1985 Second Primary Education Project
1987			Third Primary Education Project (1987-97)		
1988	Return to democracy First party based polls since 1977	BEMIS EMIS SEMIS FEMIS	NEMIS for generating data especially at primary level	USAID (Bridges Study researching prim.education in progress)	Last comprehensive (all levels of educ) ESW by the Bank.
1989	Pakistan rejoins Commonwealth	NAP joins IJI in NWFP EMIS set up in Punjab		UN: Convention on the Rights of the Child	
1990	Democratically elected government of Benazir Bhutto dismissed by the President. Interim Prime Minister appointed. Nawaz Sharif elected Prime Minister. US aid to Pakistan cut off under Pressler Amendment	Balochistan province lowest indicators re female education. Start of USAID funded Balochistan Primary Education Project with Schools for Girls set up under the Community Support Process Sindh Primary Education Development Project (1990) The Directorate for Primary Education in NWFP started on June 1, 1990, as part of the Primary Education Development Program supported	Pakistan delegation attends EFA Conference in Jomtien in March High gender disparities : focus on girls PE HDI developed by UNDP with primary education as an indicator World Declaration on EFA: Meeting Basic Learning Needs signed	USAID UNESCO UNICEF UNDP	WB and Inter-Agency event Meeting Basic Learning Needs Preamble refers to the Universal Declaration of Human Rights, in which 40 nations asserted that "everyone has a right to education". Framework for Action developed. World Bank Primary Education Policy Paper(1990).

		by USAID (1990-1994).			
1991	Financial sector liberalization and denationalization initiated NRSP				Famous article on"Washington Consensus" by J.Williams formalizes adjustment policies of 1980s.
1992	Social Action Program (SAP)initiated	Punjab Middle School Project 1992 NWFP: NEAP & FEF Primary Education Charsadda Project – GTZ & KfW (1992-96) merged into PEP-ILE. Community Primary Schools –UNICEF.	Primary Education key sector under SAP Establishment of Provincial Education Foundations	DFID: PMSP	PMSP
1993	Eighth Five Year Plan (1993-8) Prime Minister Nawaz Sharif dismissed by President and caretaker PM appointed. Supreme Court restores Nawaz Sharif. Both President and PM forced to resign by COAS. Moeen Qureshi becomes caretaker PM & Senate Chairman becomes President. Benazir Bhutto becomes PM again		Coed girls primary schools	BPEP – USAID & UNICEF	IMF-WB-Pakistan Policy Framework Paper for loan agreements SAPP-I: 1993-97
1994	Taliban movement with possible involvement of Pakistani madrassah students	NWFP: Primary Education Girls Project (PE-GP) – ADB (1992-96). Middle schools Project – ADB (1994-99). Improvement of Primary Education – JICA (1994-96). -ODA Project CPE Act – Punjab,	SAP I: 60/40 ratio in favour of constructing girls primary schools WFP for increasing girls enrolment	ADB World Food Program JICA	SDR 1billion in 1994 Social Action Program I. 1994

		NWFP			
1995	PMs visit to US and promise of easing sanctions Brown amendment expected	Quality projects in all provinces: PEP-ILE started in 1995-96 PEQIP NWFP-Primary Education Programme – SAPP-I&II		Fourth World Conference on Women: 1995 RNE (gender)	James D. Wolfensohn President of WB (poverty, debt relief, decentralization)
1996	Benazir Bhutto's government dismissed by President. Caretaker PM	Technical Support to NWFP-PEP (DFID)		DFID	Education Sector Priorities Paper. Analyzed all levels, but recommends emphasis on primary.
1997	Nawaz Sharif' PML wins landslide victory. PML nominates President 13th Amendment to Constitution. Pakistan recognizes Taliban government in Afghanistan Foreign currency accounts frozen and loss of investor confidence	NWFP: Taskforce for Elementary Education	PMSP	ADB, DfID, EC, RNE	SAPP II
1998	India carries out fresh nuclear tests. Pakistan responds with nuclear explosion. Economic sanctions imposed especially by USA and Japan. Shari'ah Bill introduced by Nawaz Sharif. NSC proposal turned down by PM, COAS resigns and replaced by General Pervez Musharraf	Northern Areas Education Project April 1998 to December 2003	Social Action Program II.1998	DFID: NAEP £6 million project	Social Action Program II.1998
1999	Lahore Declaration signed between Pakistan and				Education Sector Strategy. Continue support for EFA

	India. War in Kargil. General Musharraf's coup d'etat				within holistic sector approach for all levels and dialogue with country.
2000	Nawaz Sharif sent into exile Local Government system introduced Pakistan Poverty Alleviation Fund (PPAF) established		Pakistan attends Dakar EFA Conference Primary Education decentralized under LGO to district level	UNESCO April 2000 World Education Forum in Dakar supported Pakistan: EFA Assessment Report 2000	WB support to PPAF
2001	General Musharraf names himself president while remaining head of army. Attempts at détente with India foiled by militants 9/11	Restructuring of NEF	Education Sector Reforms Action Plan.2001-2004 National EFA Plan 2001-2015 NEAS set up Ratio of 70:30 for constructing new girls schools under SAP	CIDA:Pakistan-Canada Basic Education Program Cdn $10 million over five years for support to ESR plus debt swaps up to $447 million in the social sector.	
2002	Militant groups banned Fears of Pak-India war General Musharraf's referendum for another five years in office. Local Body Elections held Jamali from Balochistan as PM NCHD set up	PML(Q) in Punjab PML(Q) plus MQM in Sindh PML(Q) plus MMA in Balochistan MMA in NWFP	Revision of National Curriculum Classes I-X & ECE curriculum developed Incentive package for private sector NCHD: UPE programme		SAP II closed
2003	Musharraf's US visit Moody's raises Pakistan's foreign debt rating India proposes peace Selling of nuclear secrets emerges as an issue	MMA government in NWFP declares Shari'ah law in province University of Education set up in Punjab	Aga Khan Examination Board PESRP: Punjab ESRA : Sindh & Balochistan 7 Grants in all provinces	USAID : ESRA DfID for teacher training component	Social Action Program II ICR. 2003 PESRP in Punjab
2004	Pakistan rejoins Commonwealth Shaukat Aziz becomes PM	Punjab Education Reform Adjustment Credit I. 2004 Northern Education ICR 2004		"Barcelona consensus"by group of prominent development economists.Calls for more balanced than "WashingtonConsensus	WB supported validation of survey data

2005	Restructuring of PEF Punjab Education Reform Adjustment Credit II 2005	PPAF to support Primary Education		Paul Wolfowitz as the new Chief of the WB. New Bank report on lessons from growth in 1990s.Calls for more balance.

Annex B. Inventory of Development Assistant: World Bank and Other

Support provided by development partner agencies has been aimed a expanding and improving the quality and relevance of basic education and reform of education in the perspective of lifelong education. Several initiatives have been undertaken with government and NGOs focusing on education of girls/women, street/working children reaching the unreached, and technical and vocational education during the last decade. The main focus of donor's support has been on primary and middle level education - 68%. In Technical and Managerial Education and Training 13% mostly ADB and NORAD, for education equipment and university education 7% and other 12%. In addition, JICA (77%) and CIDA (92%) have also invested in educational equipment and university education. Between 1990 and 2001, contributions by donors in descending order are: WB/IDA, ADB, JICA, USAID, DFID, EC, UNICEF, CIDA, NORAD and NEDA. (In case of some donors information is incomplete).

B.1: OVERVIEW OF ASSISTANCE

Donor Agency	Area of Interest	Geographical Focus
ADB	-Middle School Project (Diploma in IT for girls)	Federal/Sindh
(Loan)	-Technical Education Project	National
	-Second Science Education Project	Federal/Sindh/NWFP/Baloch.
	-Second Girls Primary Education Project	National
	-Primary School Quality Ed. (teacher training)	National
	-Decentralized School Management	Punjab
	-Non-formal education for rural women	Punjab
World Bank/IDA*	-Northern Education Project	AJK/Gilgit
	-NWFP-PEP	NWFP
(Loan)	-Database	Federal
	-NEAS	[[Sindh/Balochistan?]]
	-Training Councilors (US$3million)	
	-PERSP	
		Punjab
DFID	-NWFP-PEP	NWFP
	-NAEP	Northern Areas
(Grant)	-NEAS	Federal
	-EMIS Status Study	Federal/Prov.
	-Devolution Workshops	Federal/Prov.
	-NEF	Federal
	(i)Northern Areas Phase II	Northern Areas
	(ii)Community participation in AJK project	AJK
	(iii)Policy research dev.	Federal/Prov.
	(iv)Financing study	Federal/Prov. (Punjab/NWFP)
EC	-IED	AKU
	-AKES,NEP	AKF/AKDN
	-District based initiatives	
	Community and rural primary education	Sindh and Balochistan

NEDA	-Education Quality Improvement through Community Education	Balochistan
(Grant)	-PEP-ILE	NWFP
USAID	-Teacher training/quality with Child Resource International (CRI-USA)	National
	-ESRA: Primary Education: (i)Teacher Training (ii)Madrassah Education (iii)Grants to NGOs	National, Balochistan, Sindh
US Department of Labour	Child Labour education	Punjab – 2 districts
JICA	-Technical Education -Devolution	Punjab, Balochistan, NWFP
(Grant-in-Aid) US $38 million		
AUS-AID	Girls Education Project	Balochistan (4 districts)
UNICEF	-Girls Education Project	Balochistan (4 districts)
	-UPE	Punjab (6 districts)
(Grant)	-More Children in School	NWFP (Kohat) &
	-Quality Prim. Ed. Joyful learning	Sindh (Thatta)
US $ 1.1 million for Education in 2002 (3 years: 2.2 million)	-Learning Achievements (focus access and enrolment)	National
	-Afghan refugees in Pakistan and in Afghanistan	Balochistan and Punjab (3 southern districts)
UNDP	-Developing system of public accountability (w/CIET) -Devolution -Trust for Community Empowerment	National
UNESCO	*Ongoing:*	
US $100,000	-Developing system of public accountability (w/CIET)	National
	-Orientation/training seminars	Punjab
	-NF/community mobilization	Selected districts
	-Training of female teachers	Selected districts
	-Women's Literacy and Empowerment project	Sindh
	-Quality education (Curriculum, tests dev. and testing students, training packages)	National and Provinces
	-Technical Education (TA) -Human rights education -Focus EFA	
	Proposed: IT and Distance Learning Afghan refugees in Pakistan and in Afghanistan	
NORAD	*Ongoing:*	
	-Institutional dev. & research bet. Univ. of Peshawar	NWFP
	-Strengthening School Committees under SAP (w/MSU)	National (Punjab, Sindh)
GTZ	*Ongoing:* Quality of education (textbooks, teacher training)	NWFP
MSU	*On-going:*	

	-Study of private schools	Punjab, Sindh
	-Human rights education	NWFP (Peshawar University)
		Punjab
CIDA	*Ongoing:*	
	-Strengthening Rural Primary Education	National
(Grant) Cdn.10 million (3 yrs)	-TRC-SIDP- ECE	Sindh
	-IED/AIE Citizenship Rights & human rights project	Punjab
	-LUMS/McGill Linkage - II	Punjab
	-IED-SIDP	Punjab
	-TA to MOE	Sindh
	Pipeline:	Federal
	Pak-Canada Basic Education Project	
Human Development Foundation	NFBE	National (13 selected districts)

World Bank: developing a Database, supporting NEAS (WB and DFID teaming up as partners, and unutilized SAP II funds diverted to NEAS)

B.2: Inventory of Non-Bank Assistance to Pakistan (1990-2003)

Commitment Year	Donor Name	Amount (US$ 000)	% Grant Element	Short Description	Expected completion date
1990	Norway	2189.13	100	PAPER DELIVERY	
1990	Norway	3083.95	100	PAPER DELIVERY	
1990	Norway	3782.24	100	PRIMARY EDUCATION	
1990	Norway	4500	100	PRIMARY EDUCATION	
1990	United States	24000	100	PRIMARY EDUCATION	
1990	IDA	112500	78.21	PRIMARY EDUCATION, SINDH PROVINCE	
1991	Norway	894.74	100	PRIMARY EDUCATION	
1991	United States	26000	100	PRIMARY EDUCATION	
1992	Germany	6412.31	100	PRIMARY EDUCATION	06/01/1992
1992	Netherlands	378.25	100	PRIMARY EDUCATION	
1992	Sweden	45.5	100	PRIMARY EDUCATION	
1993	Netherlands	3365.28	100	PRIMARY EDUCATION	
1993	Norway	324.29	100	CONSULTANCY FUND - EDUC. SECTOR	
1993	IDA	106000	78.97	PRIMARY EDUCATION	
1994	Netherlands	10990.82	100	PRIMARY EDUC./SOCIAL ACTION PROG.	12/01/1995
1994	Japan	13855.19	100	PRIMARY EDUCATION IMPROVEMENT	11/01/1998
1995	Netherlands	124.61	100	SOCIAL ACTION PROGRAMME	
1995	United Kingdom	6297.35	100	PRIM. EDUCATION NW PROVINCE	12/31/1996
1995	IDA	150000	78.87	NWFP PRIMARY EDUCATION	12/01/2002
1996	Austria	4.73	100	EDUCATION PROGRAM	01/07/1997
1996	Germany	26516.91	100	PRIMARY EDUCATION PROGRAMME	01/06/2000
1996	Netherlands	622.74	100	PRIMARY EDUCATION	01/07/2001
1996	Netherlands	5337.76	100	PRIMARY EDUCATION	01/02/1999
1996	Netherlands	2730.56	100	PRIMARY EDUCATION	01/12/1997
1996	Netherlands	1132.2	100	PRIMARY EDUCATION	
1997	Netherlands	5125.84	100	PRIMARY EDUCATION	
1997	United Kingdom	737.1	100	PRIM. EDUCATION NW PROVINCE	
1997	United Kingdom	665.03	100	PRIMARY EDUCATION	
1997	AsDF	42903.54	71.3	2ND GIRLS PRIMARY SCHOOL SECT. PROJ.	06/01/2003

1998	Belgium	55.1	100	PARTICIPATION À ÉDUCATION DE BASE	12/01/1998
1998	Netherlands	17636.68	100	PRIMARY EDUC.: SOCIAL ACTION PROGRAM	01/01/1999
1998	Netherlands	21.67	100	PRIMARY EDUCATION	05/31/2001
1998	Netherlands	28.72	100	BALOCHISTAN PRIMARY EDUCATION	
1998	Australia	1036.24	100	GIRLS PRIMARY SCHOOL EDUCATION PROJECT	
1999	Belgium	34.07	100	FORMATION INSTITUTRICES PRIMAIRES AFGHANES / ONG	08/01/2000
1999	Germany	73.28	100	BASIC EDUCATION TO AFGHAN REFUGEES	08/01/1999
1999	Netherlands	49.8	100	PRIMARY EDUCATION: SUPPORT FUND	12/01/1999
1999	Netherlands	46.9	100	PRIMARY EDUCATION	12/01/1999
1999	Norway	21.8	100	PRIMARY EDUCATION	12/01/1999
1999	Norway	109.79	100	PRIMARY EDUCATION	12/01/1999
1999	Norway	16.42	100	PRIMARY EDUCATION	12/31/1998
1999	Norway	128.26	100	PRIMARY EDUCATION	
1999	United Kingdom	80.89	100	PRIM. EDUCATION NW PROVINCE	07/01/2002
2000	Belgium	19.65	100	FORMATION INSTITUTRICES PRIMAIRES AFGHANES RÉFUGIÉES AU PAKISTAN	12/31/2003
2000	Netherlands	692.54	100	BASIC EDUC.: EDUCATIONAL QUALITY IMPROVEMENT	04/01/2005
2000	Norway	1193.63	100	BASIC EDUCATION: SUPPORT TO SCHOOL MANAGEMENT COMMITTEE	
2000	Canada	350.14	100	RURAL PRIMARY EDUCATION	
2000	UNICEF	1577.6	100	PRIMARY EDUCATION	
2000	UNICEF	361.21	100	BASIC EDUCATION: PROJECT SUPPORT	12/01/2005
2001	Germany	1373.71	100	PRIMARY EDUCATION	
2001	Norway	111.2	100	MODEL SCHOOL	
2001	Spain	215	100	AGRANDISSEMENT ET ÉQUIPEMENT DE 5 ÉCOLES RELIGIEUSES AU PAKISTAN	
2001	Spain	26.91	100	PRIMARY EDUCATION	
2001	UNICEF	334	100	BASIC EDUCATION: PROJECT SUPPORT	
2001	UNICEF	952	100	PRIMARY EDUCATION	12/31/2008
2002	Germany	424.09	100	GOVERNMENT CONTRIBUTIONS VIA NGO	12/31/2007
2002	Norway	5635.14	100	FATA COMMUNITY SCHOOLS	01/01/2004
2002	Norway	4132.44	100	UNIVERSAL QUALITY PRIMARY EDUCATION	

2002	Norway	22.6	100	TRAINING OF MENTALLY HANDICAPPED	
2002	Spain	13.49	100	SEVERAL CO-OPERATION PROJECTS FOR THE DEVELOPMENT	03/31/2005
2002	Spain	28.27	100	EDUCATION QUALITY IMPROVEMENT IN HUSHÉ	
2002	Canada	318.47	100	BASIC EDUCATION	
2002	United States	10000	100	PAKISTAN BASIC EDUCATION PROGRAM	05/31/2001
2002	United States	5000	100	PAKISTAN BASIC EDUCATION PROGRAM	
2002	Australia	448.46	100	GIRLS PRIMARY SCHOOL EDUCATION PROJECT	
2002	UNICEF	587.44	100	BASIC EDUCATION, PROJECT SUPPORT	
2002	UNICEF	491.28	100	PRIMARY EDUCATION	
2002	UNICEF	80.14	100	PRIMARY EDUCATION	
2002	UNICEF	79.71	100	ADOLESCENT LEARNING	
2003	Germany	186.4	100	GOVERNMENT CONTRIBUTIONS VIA NGO	
2003	Germany	2824.22	100	EDUCATION SECTOR DEVELOPMENT PROGRAMME - NWFP	01/01/2006
2003	Norway	3.67	100	PRIMARY EDUCATION	11/01/1998
2003	Norway	10257.86	100	EDUCATION DEVELOPMENT FUND	
2003	United Kingdom	409.84	100	PRIM. EDUCATION NW PROVINCE	12/31/2003
2003	Ireland	127.06	100	AGENCY FOR PERSONAL SERVICE OVERSEAS (APSO)	
2003	Greece	29.25	100	SUPPORT TO PRIMARY EDUCATION	06/19/2006
2003	United States	21500	100	PAKISTAN PRIMARY EDUCATION AND LITERACY PROGRAM	
2003	Australia	2335.39	100	GIRLS PRIMARY SCHOOL EDUCATION PROJECT	
2003	AsDF	79007	71.18	DECENTRALIZATION ELEMENTARY EDUCATION PROJECT	
2003	UNICEF	391.06	100	PRIMARY EDUCATION	
2003	UNICEF	138.76	100	ADOLESCENT LEARNING	
2003	UNICEF	588.19	100	PROJECT SUPPORT	12/31/2005
2003	UNICEF	139.91	100	PRIMARY EDUCATION	03/31/2005
2004	Finland	57.55	100	VILLAGE SCHOOL	11/30/2010
2004	Canada	7619.63	100	BASIC EDUCATION	
2004	Canada	838.16	100	DEBT CONVERSION MONITORING & EVALUATION	

B.3: World Bank Education Specific Projects in Pakistan (1985 – Present)

Project	Status	Approved ($mill.)	Description of Objectives
Second Prim. Educ (1985)	Closed (1993)	72	The objectives of the proposed project are to improve quality and find an effective strategy for raising literacy and student achievement. The major objectives of the project would be to: a) Improve teacher effectiveness through the provision of (i) instructional guides and training materials that organize the curriculum into a set of tightly structured lessons, (ii) in-service training courses in the effective use and further elaboration of these materials, and (iii) continuing training and support through on-the-job supervision and guidance (b) develop low-cost primary education through (i) the use of assistant teachers; (ii) the development of low-cost, low-maintenance school buildings; (iii) increasing average student-teacher ratios; and (iv) developing national policies which encourage low-cost primary schooling.
Third Prim. Punjab (1987)	Closed (1997)	143	The Third Primary Education Project supports the broad goal of the Government to achieve universal primary education by the year 2000. The project concentrates on the Punjab province but also has some national aspects. The main objective of the project is to support the core program of the Punjab's Five-Year primary education investment program. The specific objectives include: (a) improving institutional capacity to plan, manage and implement the investment program; (b) supporting policy reform; and (c) supporting innovations in the delivery of primary education. To that end, the project entails (i) management improvement; (ii) curriculum development and materials supply; (iii) teacher training; (iv) communications/ demand generation; and (v) finally, school construction. With the last component, the project supports concentrating on the building of new girls schools and providing facilities for existing shelterless girls schools. This is in line with the overall Government strategy to increase female enrollments.
Sindh Primary (1990)	Closed (1998)	112	The objectives of the proposed project are to: (a) increase participation in schooling in rural and urban slum areas, with emphasis on girls; (b) enhance delivery of primary education; and (c) increase student learning and achievement. Participation would be increased by: (a) improving access facilities and school maintenance; and (b) providing incentives to improve enrollment and retention of children in school. Delivery would be improved by: (a) introducing measures to enhance the recruitment, motivation and retention of teachers; (b) improving the supply, training and supervision of teachers; and (c) improving planning, management and implementation of primary education. Student achievement would be enhanced by improving the quality, durability, distribution and availability of teaching and learning materials, textbooks and supplementary reading materials.
Punjab Mid.School (1992)	Closed ([[ ]])	115	The objectives of the project are to: (a) improve access and participation in middle schooling in rural and urban slum areas, especially for girls; (b) improve quality and increase student learning and achievement; and (c) strengthen related policy-making, planning, management, monitoring and evaluation capacity. Access and participation will be improved by: (a) providing facilities and enhancing maintenance; (b) providing incentives to increase female participation; (c) assisting the government in formulating policies and implementing a pilot program aimed at enhancing the role of local government in management and delivery of elementary education; and (d) promoting community and private sector participation in elementary education. Quality will be improved by: (a) enhancing teacher effectiveness; (b) improving learning assessment capacity through development of expertise in testing and examinations; and (c) developing more effective materials in middle schooling. Policy-making, planning, management, monitoring and evaluation capacity will be strengthened through: (a) supporting development of policy formulation and school planning capabilities at the provincial and district levels; (b) reorganizing elementary education management and administration at provincial, divisional and district levels; and (c) developing monitoring and evaluation capacity to design, conduct and disseminate research in student achievement and participation in elementary education.
Balochistan	Closed	106	The objectives are to: (a) improve access, equity and efficiency; (b)

Prim.(1993)	(1999)		improve quality of the learning environment; and (c) improve the organizational framework, planning and management. Beneficiary participation would be instituted as a means to achieve all of the above objectives. Access. equitv and efficiency would be increased by: (a) establishing new girls' schools which boys are allowed to attend; (b) providing classrooms and facilities to mixed shelterless schools; and (c) introducing a scholarship program for girls in urban slum areas to attend privately-run schools. A new policy would be introduced to permit double-shifts where needs arise. Oualitv of the learning environment would be improved by: (a) establishing an appropriate pre-service and in-service teacher training system geared to the multi-grade school conditions in Balochistan; (b) developing core student-activity books and other instructional materials, suitable for multi-grade teaching and learning. An instructional support system using learning coordinators would be institutionalized. organizational framework. Planning and management would be improved by: (a) establishing a Directorate of Primary Education separate from the secondary school administration at provincial and district levels; (b) establishing a policy monitoring and evaluation unit within the Directorate of Primary Education; and (c) continuing the development of the management information system to facilitate planning and management. To achieve the above objectives, beneficiary participation would be instituted by setting up parents' committees, and involving these committees in school establishment and supervision. The program would finance construction, furniture, equipment and educational materials, specialist services, fellowships, training, incremental recurrent cost for additional staff, and operation and maintenance.
NWFP Primary (1995)	Closed ( )	150	The objectives are to improve: (a) access, equity and efficiency; (b) the quality of the learning environment, and (c) the organizational framework, and the planning, management, assessment and monitoring capacity of the provincial education system; and (d) to increase village-level beneficiary involvement in all phases of primary education service delivery.
Northern Education (1998)	Closed ( )	23	The Northern Education Project's objectives are: a) to improve the quality of education, increase learning achievement and improve completion rates in elementary education; b) to increase access, equity, and retention of students, particularly girls; c) to strengthen institutional capacity to plan and manage educational programs; and d) to encourage greater community and nongovernmental organization participation. The project consists of four main components: 1) improving educational quality by instituting changes in teacher recruitment and training, developing curriculum and educational materials, and developing assessment capacity; 2) increasing equitable access -improving the quantity, physical quality, and gender balance of elementary schools operating in the Northern areas and Azed Jammu and Kashmir by rebuilding dangerous schools and erecting new school buildings for currently shelterless schools; erecting community schools buildings with community participation; and helping to establish a maintenance capacity in each school for receiving interventions to improve physical infrastructure; 3) strengthening the management capacity of the Department/Directorate of Elementary Education through organizational changes, providing limited additional staff, training, and technical assistance; improving the information base for planning and management decisions by conducting baseline studies, rationalizing information flows, and developing information management systems at the local level; and regularly monitoring and evaluating the proposed five-year program; and 4) supporting community participation in the Northern areas by supporting and improving the existing community schools program; and in Azad Jammu and Kashmir, by establishing school committees in existing government schools.
National Assessment (2003)	Active	3.6	The National Education Assessment System for Pakistan aims to design and administer assessment mechanisms to establish administrative infrastructure and capacity for assessment administration, analysis and report writing, and to increase stakeholder knowledge and acceptance of assessment. There are three components to the project: 1) Capacity building would be the main component, where the execution of an assessment is unusually technical in nature. Any one of a number of small mistakes can cause serious delays in implementation and, in the worst case, lead to meaningless findings. Therefore, a high-level technical assistance,

	including the services o f a senior Technical Advisor, would be required to monitor and assist in all aspects of both central and provincial operations. 2) Pilot experiments will be required to determine what will produce the desired, valid results, and what process is most implemented. 3) Information dissemination. Through this component, the project will facilitate information dissemination about assessment to stakeholders in advance of the actual assessment to explain its purpose and provide insight and reassurance about its intended use.

B.4: World Bank Adjustment Programs with Support for Primary Education

Program	Status	Approved ($mill.)	Brief Description of Education within Program
SAP1 (1994)	Closed	200 (60% Ed)	The SAP project supports the overall implementation of the Government's Social Action Program, which aims to reverse Pakistan's historic under-investment in social welfare, and thus to increase educational attainment, improve health status, and slow population growth. It calls for improvement and expansion of all four of the country's basic social services -- primary education, primary health care, population, and rural water supply and sanitation.
SAP2 (1998)	Closed	250 (60% Ed)	The overall goal of the Second Social Action Program Project (SAPP II) is to improve the quality of social services, and to increase practical access to and use of these basic services, particularly for women and girls and more generally for the poor. While SAPP II will work mainly with government, it will also strengthen and finance nongovernmental organization (NGO) and private sector efforts through fostering partnerships and establishing funding and communication mechanisms to directly support these efforts
SAC (2001)	Closed	500 (12% Ed)	The national Structural Adjustment Credit Project will support implementation of the Government's Poverty Reduction Strategy by: improving governance, through tax reform, devolution, decentralization, improved financial management, civil service reform, and public access to information; by strengthening the foundations for economic growth, through regulatory reforms, privatization, and pricing policies of power, and, oil and gas public companies; and, by improving the delivery of social services, through strengthened leadership, improved incentives to influence delivery of services, and, an eased transition from provincial-based, to district-based service delivery.
SAC (Sindh) 2002	Closed	100 (20% Ed)	The objective of the proposed credit is to support the wide-ranging reforms being implemented by the Government of Sindh (GoS) province in Pakistan after taking office in April 2000. These reforms, led by strong champions in the government, including the Governor of the province, the Cabinet, and committed civil servants, aim to reduce poverty in Pakistan's second largest province and home of 30 million people by improving public service delivery and stimulating growth.
SAC (NWFP) 2002	Closed	90 (20% Ed)	The North West Frontier Province Structural Adjustment Credit Project, supports the economic, and social reform program of the Province, and builds on four pillars: 1) strengthening provincial governance through civil service reform, to strengthen accountability, integrity, and institutional framework; 2) strengthening public health, and education delivery systems, including devolution of responsibilities to expand access to these services, with a focus on primary service delivery; 3) fiscal, and financial management reforms, to increase provincial revenues, reprioritize expenditures, strengthen procurement, and improve budget preparation and implementation; and, 4) deregulation, and business facilitations to enhance prospects for growth, and poverty alleviation.
SAC2 (NWFP) 2004	Closed	90 (20% Ed)	The Second Structural Adjustment Credit Project (SAC2) for the North West Frontier Province (NWFP) is based on the progress on the indicative triggers that were documented in the first SAC for the NWFP. The reform program is based on five pillars (a) fiscal reforms; (b) public financial management and accountability reforms, (c) reforms to accelerate human development and improve service delivery in key sectors (especially basic social services); (d) governance reforms to achieve an efficient, accountable, and service oriented civil service; and (e) promoting growth and private sector development.
PRSC (Nat.) 2004	Closed	300 (18% Ed)	This Poverty Reduction Support Credit Project (PRSC) will support the implementation of the Government's Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper (PRSP), which focuses on: accelerating economic growth, while maintaining macro stability, by improving governance and devolution, and investing in human capital, but targeting the poor. The PRSC program will support accelerated progress in human capital, by focusing on measures that are the responsibility of the federal government, namely, strengthening national sector policy in health and education; improving the public expenditure framework for health and education; and, promoting increased data generation, monitoring of outcomes, and

			program evaluation.
Punjab I (2004)	Closed (2004)	100	The purpose of this Education Sector Adjustment Credit for Pakistan is to provide financing for the Province of Punjab, which has embarked on a wide-ranging reform agenda to improve fiscal management, promote devolution and improve service delivery starting with education. The credit is the first of a series of three adjustment credits to support the Government of Punjab's medium-term sector-wide reform program to enhance access and quality of education. Punjab is reallocating public expenditures towards education and other pro-poor programs, and implementing national initiatives on decentralization and the accompanying public finance and management reforms, using the education sector as the leading sector. The Government has developed a Punjab Education Sector Reform Program (PESRP) Strategy that is consistent with the National Education Sector Reform Program. The Punjab ESRP has three pillars: (A) public finance reforms to realign expenditures at the provincial and district level toward education and other pro-poor expenditures; (B) devolution and public sector management reforms; and (C) education sector reforms to improve quality, access, and governance of the education system. These reforms will be fully implemented over a three-year period. The first two pillars of the reforms are also supported by the Asian Development Bank (ADB) under the Punjab Resource Management Program (PRMP). The Punjab Government has also developed a Provincial PRSP, which, among other things, supports the devolution of decision making and finances to districts and provides the impetus for public finance and management reforms. These reforms are being undertaken concurrently. As earlier experience in Pakistan shows, education sector reforms cannot be successful without reforms in public finance management and governance. While significant actions were taken prior to the first IDA Credit, this reform program envisages completion of future actions by FY06. The main benefits come from reversing the slide in education indicators, bringing more children (particularly poor children and girls) into school, up to grade 8 sooner than previously expected, and providing them with better quality education. Another indirect but important benefit is that the program would help strengthen decentralization by increasing the role of districts and promoting accountability between service users (parents and students) and service providers (schools and teachers). The credit will be disbursed in a single tranche upon credit effectiveness.
Punjab II (2005)	Active	100	Within the wide-range reform agenda of the Government of Pakistan, the Second Education Sector Development Policy Credit Project - Punjab Province - key pillars will support: a) public finance reforms to increase public spending for education (and other pro-poor services) and to ensure fiscal sustainability; b) reforms that strengthen devolution and improve the fiduciary environment and governance; and, c) education sector reforms to improve quality, access and sector governance. The main benefits will be reversing the slide in education indicators, bringing more children into school up to grade 8 (particularly poor children and girls) sooner than previously expected, providing better quality education. The program would contribute to closing the social gap and helping the Country progress toward the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) related to poverty reduction and Education for All (EFA). Another indirect, but important, benefit is that the program is strengthening decentralization by increasing the role of districts, and promoting accountability between service users (parents and students) and service providers (schools and teachers). Overall, given the success of the first year program, the risk rating is moderate for the second year program, proposed to be supported under this project. Nevertheless, there is a need to maintain continued vigilance in case of a change of priorities and focus at the political level, both at the province and districts.

B.5: Effectiveness Ratings for World Bank Education Specific Projects in Pakistan (1985 – Present)

Project	Status	Approved ($mill.)	Disbursed ($mill.)	Outcome	Sustainablity	Institutional Development
Second Prim. Educ (1985)	Closed (1993)	72	56	MS	UN	M
Third Prim. Punjab (1987)	Closed (1997)	143	120	U	UN	N
Sindh Primary (1990)	Closed (1998)	112	96	S	L	M
Punjab Mid.School (1992)	Closed ( )	115	68	S	L	M
Balochistan Prim.(1993)	Closed (1999)	106	77	S	UN	N
NWFP Primary (1995)	Closed	150	89	S	L	M
Northern Education (1998)	Closed	23	13	S	L	SU
National Assessment (2003)	Active	3.6	na	na	na	na
Punjab I (2004)	Closed	100	100	na	na	na
Punjab II (2005)	Active	100	na	na	na	na
Total		924.6	619			

Note: "na" indicates not yet available

B.6: Effectiveness Ratings for-World Bank Adjustment Programs with Support for Primary Education

Program	Status	Approved ($mill.)	Disbursed ($mill.)	Outcome	Sustainability	Institutional Development
SAP1 (1994)	Closed	200 (60% Ed)	200	S	L	P
SAP2 (1998)	Closed	250 (60% Ed)	250	U	L	M
SAC(Nat) (2001)	Closed	500 (12% Ed)	500			
SAC (Sindh) 2002	Closed	100 (20% Ed)	100	S	L	M
SAC (NWFP) 2002	Closed	90 (20% Ed)	100	S	L	M
SAC2 (NWFP) 2004	Closed	90 (20% Ed)	na	na	na	na
PRSC (Nat.) 2004	Closed	300 (18% Ed)	na	na	na	na

Annex C: Trends in Public Expenditures for Education

Detailed expenditure data over long time periods and by categories is difficult to find for Pakistan. The most up to date source is the Public Expenditure Review (2001). Bruns and Mingat (2002) note this problems too when they were trying to assemble data for Pakistan on the education MDGs. The Bank's data base, EDSTATs, has some information which is very fragmentary, and even does not look accurate in places. What follows below gives the data available in tabular form when available, supplemented with with commentary on more limited data sources.

C.1: GDP and Population Growth Trends

	Compound Annual Average Growth Rate for			
	1980s	**90/91-94/95**	**95/96-99/00**	**00/01-02/03**
GDP	6.5	4.9	3.3	3.7
Inflation	7.2	11.5	7.9	3.4
Population	3.0		2.4	

Sources: GDP and inflation from Public Expenditure Management Review (2004)
Population growth 1990-2003 from World Development Indicators (2005) and 1980s must check historical sources. 3% often seen in documents.
Note: Last year reports GDP growth at about 8%, and the Bank projects about 6% annually over the next five years or so. Basically, things look better with GDP growth up and population growth declining, giving rising GDP per capita.

C.2: Total Budget and Education Budget

	'92	**'93**	**'94**	**'95**	**'96**	**'97**	**'98**	**'99**	**'00**	**'01**
Total Budget	645.4	644.0	625.1	636.2	718.0	654.8	684.5	660.1	709.1	703.7
Educ.Budget	50.4	50.4	51.8	54.9	55.9	49.8	53.4	50.8	54.0	54.0
Total Budget (%GDP)	26.7	26.2	24.5	23.7	25.5	23.1	23.5	21.9	22.5	21.8
Educ.Budget (%GDP)	2.1	2.0	2.0	2.0	2.0	1.8	1.8	1.7	1.7	1.7

Comment: In 2001, primary education was about 0.8% of GDP, which the Public Expenditure Review notes appears to be typical of the 1990s.
Notes: Total budget and education budget is in millions of Rs at 1999/2000 prices. '92 designates the Pakistan fiscal year 1991/92. This represents an annual growth rate of about only 0.8% for education spending, and by implication about the same for primary education spending.
Source: Adapted from Public Expenditure Management Review (2004).

C.3: Comparison of Growth in Recurrent Expenditures, Enrollments and Teachers. Primary Schools (1982-94)

	Recurrent Budget	**Enrollment**	**Teachers**
Punjab	19.6	5.2	5.5
Sindh	19.7	4.9	8.1

NWFP	21.7	6.0	8.2
Balochistan	24.2	10.4	9.7

Source: S. Kardar estimates in "The Economics of Education" in P. Hoodbhoy "Education and the State: Fifty Years of Pakistan".

Comment: These data show the growth of recurrent spending increasing much more rapidly than enrollment or the number of teachers. He interprets this as showing that a disproportionate share of budgetary allocations are taken up by increased salaries of teachers or by non-teaching personnel instead of being used for non-personnel inputs that could improve the quality of education.

Comment: The above data for the 1980s would lead one to expect teacher salaries to have risen. But most commentators on Pakistan report that primary school teacher salaries (as well as general social status) are low relative to other professions. But there is not enough rigorous and recent data on teacher salaries. However, it is interesting that Bruns and Mingat (2002) in the data set they assembled for Pakistan report that the primary school teachers salary was 3.5 times GDP per capita for the year 2000, which was not too far out of line as one of their indicative benchmarks. It is not clear how they obtained this figure for Pakistan. This topic needs further investigation in Bank ESW since it is a critical variable for policy purposes.

Annex D: Trends on Major Primary Education Development Indicators

Enrollment Rates by Time Period and Group

General Note: Many authors note that problems of completeness and consistency bedevil Pakistani education data. These are noted where appropriate, but it also emphasizes the need to review the collection of education data in Pakistan with the aim of improving it.

D.1: Data on Primary Enrollment Levels and Rates

Year	Primary School-Age Population	Total Enrollment in Primary Schools (thousand)	Female Enrollment Rate in Primary Schools (thousand)	Primary Gross Enrollment Ratio *
1990	16448173	10837	3675	61
1991		10736	3714	65
1992		12726	4596	69
1993		13288	5055	74
1994		14264	5638	68
1995	19685692	14527	5702	69
1996	20213313	17063	6156	63
1997	20676096	18169	6997	73
1998	19202418	19148	6450	
1999	19557910	17135	7044	72
2000	19894285	19521	6893	73
2001	20209797		8196	73
2002				

Source: Edstats

Ministry of Education for population in private school figures

Global Education Database (UNESCO)

*NOTE: This GER is not calculated from cols 2 and 3. There is no indication what age range was used for col 2 school age population, the result of dividing col. 3 by col 2 is not consistent with GER in col 4.

D.2: Gross Primary Enrollment Rates, by Province and Urbanicity

Grouping\Period	1990-1991		1995-1996		1998-1999		2001-2002	
	Male	Female	Male	Female	Male	Female	Male	Female
Province								
Punjab	na	na	85	70	82	68	84	69
Sindh	na	na	86	62	75	54	76	51
NWFP	na	na	80	49	84	54	97	56
Balochistan	na	na	86	63	79	46	77	44
ALL	86	59	85	64				
Urbanicity								
Urban	97	87	95	90	95	92	94	87
Rural	82	48	81	54	75	50	80	52

Source: *PIHS* 1995-1996, p. 19; and *PIHS* 2001-2002, p. 23. GER is calculated by dividing the number of children attending grades 1-5 by the number of children aged 5-9 in the population, and multiplying by 100.

D.3: Gross Primary Enrollment Rates, by Province and Income Quintile

Province and Income Group	1995-1996				2001-2002			
	Urban		Rural		Urban		Rural	
	Male	Female	Male	Female	Male	Female	Male	Female
Punjab								
Quintile 1	76	68	61	35	59	57	55	39
Quintile 2	90	89	71	56	94	75	68	53
Quintile 3	97	96	83	69	111	94	95	61
Quintile 4	115	111	105	80	108	109	99	80
Quintile 5	108	105	103	92	109	120	109	88
Sindh								
Quintile 1	82	67	54	29	74	55	49	23
Quintile 2	93	92	83	33	71	52	68	37
Quintile 3	93	105	71	37	85	72	72	42
Quintile 4	119	96	92	45	98	94	87	44

Quintile 5	105	109	112	62	110	96	105	68
NWFP								
Quintile 1	79	53	76	20	89	46	87	38
Quintile 2	92	70	65	35	89	77	87	48
Quintile 3	72	98	82	44	90	88	98	60
Quintile 4	115	94	82	50	119	104	119	55
Quintile 5	95	109	92	77	117	101	105	78
Balochistan								
Quintile 1	71	53	71	60	81	69	57	30
Quintile 2	113	72	61	37	92	58	61	32
Quintile 3	88	62	86	63	101	61	87	46
Quintile 4	109	79	93	72	102	73	89	43
Quintile 5	110	99	110	84	109	122	76	40

Source: *PIHS* 1995-1996, p. 26; and *PIHS* 2001-2002, p. 38. GER is calculated by dividing the number of children attending grades 1-5 by the number of children aged 5-9 in the population, and multiplying by 100.

D.4: Gross Primary Enrollment Rates

Grouping\Period	1990-1991	
	Male	Female
Province		
Punjab	77.3	57.6
Sindh	64.4	44.4
NWFP	78.5	37.1
Balochistan	56.4	23.3
Urbanicity		
Rural	70.6	40.0
Urban	80.9	72.7

Source*: Pakistan Integrated Household Survey Final Results, 1991*. (p. 64) This table uses children aged 5-10, a total of 6 years, so assume it includes katchi.class. Thus this is slightly different from Table 2 definitions.

D.5: Net Enrollment Rates

Grouping\Period	1990-1991		1995-1996		1998-1999		2001-2002	
	Male	Female	Male	Female	Male	Female	Male	Female
Province								
Punjab	na	na	50	39	47	40	47	43
Sindh	na	na	50	39	47	35	46	34
NWFP	na	na	42	28	47	30	48	33
Balochistan	na	na	51	39	44	28	39	24
ALL	na	na	49	38	47	37	46	38
Urbanicity								
Urban	na	na	56	55	58	56	57	54
Rural	na	na	47	31	43	30	43	33

Source: *PIHS* 2001-2002, p. 29 and p. 39. NER is calculated by dividing the number of children aged 5-9 who are attending grades 1-5 by the number of children aged 5-9 in the population and multiplying by 100.

Net Enrollment Rates

Province and Income Group	1995-1996				2001-2002			
	Urban		Rural		Urban		Rural	
	Male	Female	Male	Female	Male	Female	Male	Female
Punjab	na	na	na	na	58	57	43	38
Quintile 1	44	41	39	19	33	29	31	25
Quintile 2	53	49	40	31	58	52	38	34
Quintile 3	52	62	50	38	58	50	47	37
Quintile 4	66	66	59	44	61	70	54	47
Quintile 5	71	71	64	50	74	78	61	58
Sindh	na	na	na	na	56	50	41	25
Quintile 1	47	36	27	17	46	28	29	16
Quintile 2	51	32	48	19	44	35	42	26
Quintile 3	57	61	45	23	54	44	44	30
Quintile 4	77	61	54	29	60	59	47	30
Quintile 5	75	82	58	42	67	68	59	44

NWFP	na	na	na	na	58	51	46	31
Quintile 1	43	38	40	11	50	32	36	22
Quintile 2	46	34	34	20	48	43	43	27
Quintile 3	49	60	39	25	58	53	51	36
Quintile 4	65	61	42	29	71	56	56	34
Quintile 5	69	72	47	41	70	64	55	52
Balochistan	na	na	na	na	55	41	36	21
Quintile 1	46	38	42	43	40	19	25	19
Quintile 2	64	40	39	23	51	35	31	16
Quintile 3	56	23	51	40	54	34	47	22
Quintile 4	58	43	56	43	51	46	41	24
Quintile 5	67	68	66	53	72	64	40	28

Source: *PIHS* 1995-1996, p. 27; and *PIHS* 2001-2002, p. 39. NER is calculated by dividing the number of children aged 5-9 who are attending grades 1-5 by the number of children aged 5-9 in the population and multiplying by 100.

D.6: Primary School Completions Rates

Cohort Survival: Percentage of students who start Grade 1 and Complete Grade 5

Province	1990	1995
Punjab	55.6	55.0
Sindh	45.6	53.5
NWFP	31.6	32.1
Balochistan	24.9	20.7

Source. SPDC 1999, Social Development in Pakistan, Annual Review as cited in “Attaining the MDGs in Pakistan”, 2005, World Bank ESW

D.7: Drop out rate (%) by grade and per capita consumption expenditure quintile

	Per Capita Consumption Expenditure Quintile				
Grade	**Bottom**	**Second**	**Third**	**Fourth**	**Top;**
1	7.4	7.8	8.3	6.0	7.2
2	7.9	9.3	7.3	9.4	12.0
3	19.1	14.4	12.3	2.9	11.5
4	39.4	25.8	19.4	14.1	11.8
5	46.4	31.0	31.1	16.1	17.6

Source: "Attaining the MDGs in Paksitan", 2005, World Bank ESW

D.8: Primary School Completion Rate (percent of 15-19 year olds completing primary)

Characteristics	Sex		
	Male	**Female**	**Both**
Urban	69.4	64.6	67.2
Rural	51.6	34.8	44.0
Punjab	57.5	47.2	52.7
Sindh	51.1	36.2	44.9
NWFP	71.4	46.7	59.8
Balochistan	42.4	23.9	33.8
Bottom quintile			36.0
Second			42.7
Third			50.5
Fourth			62.7
Top quintile			78.3
All quintiles			51.3

Source: "Attaining the MDGs in Pakistan". 2005. World Bank ESW.

D.9: LahoreTest Scores Private versus Public Schools and Cost Comparison

Percent of Schools	All private schools	Private Schools less Rs. 50 per month	Government Schools
>75% pass both tests	75%	64%	53%
>90% pass both tests	50%	36%	32%

Source: "Improving Basic Education in Pakistan". 1996. World Bank ESW.

D.10: NWFP Achievement Test Results

	Mathematics		Language	
	Private	**Public**	**Private**	**Public**
Urban	17.7	15.6	14.6	10.3
Rural	17.7	15.0	13.3	9.4
Male	17.7	14.8	13.9	8.6
Female	17.6	15.7	15.9	11.6

Source: "Improving Basic Education in Pakistan". 1996. World Bank ESW.

D.11: Lahore, Average Annual Expenditures per Student (Rs)

	Primary School	**Primary Section Middle School**	**Primary Section High School**
Private	1,070	760	960
Government	1,510	1,710	2,350

Source: "Improving Basic Education in Pakistan". 1996. World Bank ESW.

Annex E. School Visit Methods and Results

School selection

The evaluation team visited Punjab and Sindh, because of both provinces' long history of borrowing from the Bank for primary education. They are by no means the only areas who have borrowed extensively from the Bank; however, the security situation in Punjab and Sindh is relatively favorable compared to other regions and provinces. Also for logistical reasons, the team focused on schools in and around Lahore and Karachi.

Our sampling strategy was to try to identify government schools that would have been impacted by World Bank assistance, and then identify private and NGO schools nearby. This strategy allowed us to get an idea of the range of educational alternatives available to communities as well as to gain some insight into the day-to-day operation and student outcomes of non-government primary schools. The private sector in primary education in Pakistan has undergone a dramatic expansion in recent years.

The relevant World Bank projects were SAPP I and SAPP II in both Punjab and Sindh, and SPEDP in Sindh. SPEDP schools are easily identifiable as they received direct assistance from the program. We defined "SAP" schools as rural government primary schools constructed between 1995 and 1998, under the assumption that these schools would inevitably have received some, albeit indirect World Bank assistance.

Thus our sampling frame consisted of all government primary schools built between 1995 and 1998 in Lahore, rural sub-districts (tehsils) adjacent to Lahore, rural areas of Karachi, and SPEDP schools in urban Karachi. We requested a list of all schools fulfilling these criteria from the respective provincial EMIS offices and randomly selected schools from the list. Ultimately, 16 schools in total were visited; 8 in Punjab and 8 in Sindh.

Originally, we planned to visit equal numbers of boys and girls schools, but the de facto gender of schools is quite often different from its official designation; most schools at this level are in practice co-educational. Schools were thus selected without consideration to their gender designation.

Visit protocol

During the school visits, the head teacher was interviewed regarding teacher qualification and deployment; student enrollment and attendance; and school facilities and resources. Evaluation team members walked around and conducted a short inventory of the school's physical plant. The school survey was adapted from one created for another World Bank study, the Teacher Management Study[22], and is included at the end of this annex.

School visits also included a rapid assessment of student learning outcomes in math and reading. This was a very qualitative snapshot of whether students are performing at grade level, as we have no baseline data with which to compare. Ten students were selected at random from class 2 (in the same gender ratio as the entire class). They were given an arithmetic test consisting of 5

[22] *Teacher Management Study*, February 2005. Conducted by Issues and Policies Consultants, and sponsored by the World Bank and UK Department for International Development.

addition and 5 subtraction problems, based on the class 1 math curriculum. The problems were involved both one- and two-digit numbers, but did not require any carrying of digits. Thus, they received a score between 0 and 10, based on how many problems they solved correctly.

The method for the reading assessment was based on one developed and piloted by Luis Crouch and his co-authors in order to quickly, simply, and cheaply assess EFA progress[23]. We identified a short paragraph from the second half of the class 1 language textbook. The passage was selected to ensure that our assessment was based on the actual curriculum that the schools should be teaching. We timed students and counted the number of words read correctly. If they could not read the words, they were asked to identify letters, first from the passage, and then from early pages teaching the letters of the alphabet. Initially, we attempted to ask follow-up questions about the content, but so few children were even able to sound out words that it was clear little content knowledge was being acquired.

We scored the children from 1 to 4, based on the reading proficiency. A score of "1" indicates that the child could only recognize individual letters. A score of "2" indicates the child could piece together words, but very slowly. A score of "3" indicates the child could read at least half of the words in the passage. A score of "3" indicates the child was a fluent reader, who could read at least 75% of the words correctly the first time, and understand the passage.

The math assessment, as well as the passage used in Urdu-medium schools in Sindh is attached.

Results

The results presented here are based on a small sample, but still provide some useful general insights. Considering the assessments covered material the children should have mastered at least a year earlier, both reading and math scores are quite low overall. The overall mean math score was 4.49 (out of 10), meaning students had mastered less than half of the previous year's math curriculum. The overall mean reading score was 2.53, meaning the average student could read fewer than half of the words in a short paragraph, with little or no comprehension.

Urban children performed significantly better in math, but slightly worse in reading than rural children. We expected little difference in achievement based on urbanicity, as all the schools visited were within an hour of a major city. Students in Punjab performed better than their counterparts in Sindh, in both math and reading. Other studies in Pakistan have found similar differences between the provinces.

The most striking differences were between government schools and private schools. We a considered school private if it was entirely privately-run (whether for profit or not) or received substantial support from outside the government school system (such as from an NGO). None of the "private" schools in this sample were particularly elite; in fact, they mainly served children from the low and lower middle classes. However, children attending these schools scored nearly two points higher on the math assessment and nearly one point higher on the reading assessment.

---

[23] 2005. Luis Crouch, Helen Abadzi, Marcela Echegaray, Consuelo Pasco, Jessyca Sampe. "Rapid Learning Assessments and EFA Progress: A Case Study from Perú."

E.1: Results of learning assessments

	Math		Reading	
	Mean	**Standard deviation**	**Mean**	**Standard Deviation**
Province				
Punjab n = 82	4.68	2.89	2.96	1.12
Sindh n = 72	4.26	2.96	2.03	1.43
Urbanicity				
Urban n = 67	5.34	2.91	2.39	1.44
Rural n = 87	3.83	2.77	2.63	1.29
School type				
Government n = 112	3.99	2.91	2.29	1.30
Non-government n = 42	5.81	2.55	3.14	1.32

GENERAL SCHOOL DATA

Name of school: _____

Address of school: _____

District: _____ Code: _____

Tehsil: _____ Code: _____

Rural: _____ Urban: _____

EMIS School Code _____

School code for study (3 digits) [ ] [D=District; T=Tehsil; S=School code]

Type of School: Gender Boys ☐ Girls ☐ Co-ed ☐

Urbanicity Rural ☐ Urban ☐ Check if Private? ☐

(a) Physical Facilities

Facilities	No. of units	Condition of facility		
		Good No:	Needs Repair No:	Poor No:
Classrooms with fans				
Classrooms without fans				

(b)

Facilities	(Y/N)	Condition of facility		
		Good	Needs Repair	Poor
Staffroom				
Student Toilets				
Staff Toilets				
Drinking Water Facilities				

c) Blackboards: i) Number Adequate ☐ Inadequate ☐

ii) Condition Adequate ☐ Inadequate ☐

d) Consumables (stationery, chalk etc.) Adequate ☐ Inadequate ☐

e) Physical Facilities (information to be recorded only for primary students)

i) Is furniture available for writing and sitting? Yes ☐ No ☐

ii) What is the percentage of students who have sitting space?
- a) Less than 10% ☐
- b) 10 to 25% ☐
- c) 25 to 50% ☐
- d) 50 to 75% ☐
- e) More than 75% ☐

iii) What is the percentage of students who have writing space?
- a) Less than 10% ☐
- b) 10 to 25% ☐
- c) 25 to 50% ☐
- d) 50 to 75% ☐
- e) More than 75% ☐

Information on Teachers

	Primary classes (1 to 5)	Middle classes (6 to 8)	Secondary classes (9 to 12)	Total
No. of regular teachers				
No. of contract teachers				
Total				

General Information Regarding Teachers (Table to be filled for teachers of primary and elementary classes only)

Sr.	Name of teacher	Write 'A' for those absent	If absent, was prior notice given? (Y/N)	No. of days teacher was on leave /absent during last two months	Write 'C' for those who are on contract	*Academic Qualification 1=Matric; 2=Inter; 3=BA/B.Sc; 4=MA/M.Sc	**Professional Qualification 1=PTC; 2=CT; 3=BA+B.Ed	Years of teaching experience	Class taught	Subject taught	No. of in-service training courses attended	In-service training courses: Last time teacher training program was attended by the teacher after he/she started teaching? 1= 3 months later; 2= 6 months later; 3= 1-2 years later; 4=3 or more years later; 5=Never	In-service training courses: What was the duration of this training? 1=Less than two weeks, 2=Two to four weeks; 3=More than one month; 5=Never	In-service training courses: Between what period was this training conducted? 1=At a time when school was supposed to be running; 2=During school vacation; 3=On school days but after school hours; 4=Don't know
1.														
2.														
3.														
4.														
5.														
6.														
7.														
8.														
9.														
10.														

* For academic qualifications only mention highest qualification received
** For professional qualification mention all the qualifications received

Class-wise Enrolment

Class	No. of Sections	No. Of Students	No. of Students Absent
Kachi			
1			
2			
3			
4			
5			
6			
7			
8			
Total			

Class 2 Math Assessment

74 **+ 3**	**56** **+ 12**	**34** **+ 22**	**25 + 4 =**	**64 + 13 =**
65 **- 4**	**90** **- 40**	**68** **- 54**	**86 - 4 =**	**67 - 34 =**

Class 2 reading assessment used in Urdu-medium schools in Sindh

بادب بانصیب بےادب بےنصیب

Class 1
Urdu

چڑیا گھر کی سیر

ہم اتوار کو اپنے اُستاد صاحب کے ساتھ چڑیا گھر کی سیر کو گئے۔ ہم نے وہاں کچھ پنجروں میں چڑیاں بُلبُل اور طوطے دیکھے۔ اُن میں سے کچھ دانہ چُگ رہے تھے۔ کچھ پھل کُتر رہے تھے۔ چڑیاں پھُدک پھُدک کر اِدھر اُدھر آ جا رہی تھیں۔ طوطے اِدھر سے اُدھر اڑ رہے تھے۔ ہمیں یہ دیکھ کر بڑا مزا آ رہا تھا۔ برابر والے پنجروں میں عُقاب، چیل اور باز تھے۔ یہ گوشت کھا رہے تھے۔

ہم اور آگے بڑھے۔ دیکھا کہ کچھ بڑے بڑے پنجرے ہیں۔ کسی میں بھیڑیے ہیں۔ کسی میں چیتے، شیر اور کسی میں رِیچھ۔ یہ بھی گوشت کھا رہے تھے۔ ہم جنگلی جانوروں کو دیکھ کر بڑے خوش ہوئے۔ اتنے میں ایک شیر کے دھاڑنے کی آواز آئی۔ ہم سب شیر کے پنجرے کی طرف لپکے۔ شیر کو دھاڑتے دیکھ کر بڑا مزا آیا۔ پاس ہی ایک پنجرے میں بندر تھے۔ وہ

Annex F: Primary Education in Northern Areas of Pakistan

Located in the extreme north of Pakistan and administered by the federal government, the Northern Areas (NAs) are characterized by an isolated and harsh physical environment. The NA (comprising six districts – Astore, Diamer, Gilgit, Ghanche, Ghizer and Skardu) lie at the intersection of the world's highest mountain ranges – the Karakoram, Himalaya and Hindukush. In 1947, at the time of independence of Pakistan the people of NA revolted against the ruling Dogra Rajas of Kashmir and liberated their land and opted to accede to Pakistan's administration. In early 1970s, the local Rajas and Mirs were disbanded to rule the territories of their influence. In 1979, first local bodies elections were held fort the election of councilors/members of Northern Area Legislative Council (NALC). The NALC does not have the status of elected assembly for self-rule as is the case in Azad Jammu and Kashmir (AJK). Presently, NAs are governed by the Government of Pakistan (GoP) through the Kashmir Affairs and Northern Areas (KANA) and serving Federal Minister for KANA serves as Chief Executive (CE) of NALC.

Peculiar geography and its disputed status not only isolated the region but they also rendered it particularly disadvantaged and has received a very small share of country's increasing wealth during the last five decades. The region has no representation at the country's highest decision making institutions such as Parliament that also resulted in long neglect in terms of over all development and despite the rapid advances in the country, the area remains one of the most economically and socially disadvantaged in the country, with a per capita income of some 60% that of Pakistan as whole. Nearly one million people live in this region, out of which 90% live in 979 rural villages scattered over a vast areas of exceptionally mountainous terrain.

Northern Areas are also characterized by an isolated and harsh physical environment where weather conditions are severe, with cold winters and hot summers. The NAs contain some of the most fragile ecosystems in the country, which are extremely vulnerable to population pressures. The area has highest rate of population density per cultivated hectare in Pakistan. Until early 80s the entire region remained virtually isolated with subsistence agriculture as the only source of livelihood. Opening of the Karakoram Highway (KKH) in 1982 has not only provided the NA with access to the rest of Pakistan and to China but also broaden opportunities for socio-economic development. Advent of Aga Khan Development Network particularly the Aga Khan Rural Support Programme (AKRSP) has complemented government's efforts in addressing extreme poverty conditions and over success decades the overall living standards of the populace has improved significantly. These improvements in turn translated into new social conditions with shifts in priorities such as increasing demand for better quality education, higher investment in education and health at the household level and comparatively higher acceptance for girls' education.

Education in Pakistan

There is a general consensus that education in Pakistan is in a state of crisis with some of the poorest indicators for education in the world, both for women and me. Although investment

in basic education has proved to be the most powerful means for economic growth, the sector has been neglected since independence in 1947. Literacy levels are stated to be around 55% for me and 25% for women which reaches as low as 4% in rural areas. The mean years of schooling for females are an alarming 0.7 months and 2.9 months for male and over 5 million children are out of primary school. Although the state is responsible under the constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan to 'remove illiteracy and provide free and compulsory secondary education within minimum possible period (Article 37-B, Constitution of Pakistan) but the scale of progress shows that little has been done in removing widespread illiteracy through provision of basic education. Several plans were made at the national level, however, these suffered mainly due to lack of political commitment, low priority and therefore low investment and non-responsive state delivery mechanism.

Pakistan is a signatory to the Jomtien World Conference on Education for All (EFA) in which provision of universal access to and 80% completion of primary education by the year 2000 among other goals and targets were agreed upon. By the end of 2004, Pakistan is still way behind in terms of its achievements. Ten years after Jomtein (1990), countries including Pakistan reaffirmed their commitment in providing Education For All (EFA) at Dakar. As a follow up to Dakar, Pakistan initiated a number of actions/activities that resulted in to the current National Education Policy in which basic education has been assigned top priority. This was followed by approval of a Ten Year Perspective Development Plan (2001- 11) by National Economic Council (NEC) that also included Education Sector Reforms (2001-05). ESR is a short term perspective of National Education Policy and an Action Plan for 2001-05 which clearly sets targets for improvement in literacy from 49% to 60% and net primary enrolment from 66% to 76%.

The development programmes and projects in primary education already initiated/being implemented are: Social Action Programme (SAP); donor assisted Primary Education Development Projects (Northern Area Education Project in NAs), Education Sector Rerforms; Linkage of ESR/EFA to the National Poverty Reduction Strategy Programme (Khushal Pakistan, TAWANA Pakistan, Institutional Reforms and Pakistan Literacy Commission).

Primary Education in Northern Areas

The education sector in Pakistan has been neglected over the years, although successive governments have repeatedly stressed the importance of education in their planning and strategy. Like the whole of Pakistan, Northern Areas has suffered from a lack of financial and logistic support which is needed to run an effective education system. History of educational development in NA can be divided into two phases, first from independence in 1947 to 1980 in which this sector had completely neglected and second, post 80s period when the region attracted attention of the government as well as international agencies. At the independence there were only 80 primary and three middle schools for nearly 1000 villages scattered in one of world's difficult mountainous region and lack of poor access to primary education remained the major issue until mid nineties as the following table shows.

F.1: Educational Institutions in NAs since 1947 to 2002

Year	Primary	Middle	High	Colleges	Total
1947	80	03	00	00	83
1992	559	97	83	04	743
1999	1124	154	102	10	1390
2002	1393	288	192	15	1888

Despite the fact that educational policies for the whole of Pakistan simultaneously apply to the Northern Areas, educational indicators for NA have in the past fallen well below national averages. In NA, literacy was reported to be as low as 14.7% for male and 3% for female in 1981. However, during the decades of nineties the education sector, particularly primary, has received considerable attention and investment from government, NGOs and a range of international donors. But these efforts have been constrained by the region's difficult terrain, the remoteness of many communities and NA's ethno-linguistic diversity. Large disparities between male and female enrolment, high drop-out rates and low literacy were remained main issue. The percentage of school-age children in school (participation rate) at the primary level in 1994 was estimated to be 59.94 percent for boys, and 29.4 percent for girls (Directorate of Education NA 1994 figures). The decades of 90s also witnessed growth in a range of initiatives to promote education particularly quality education which includes community-based initiatives of establishing English medium schools along with NGOs such as Aga Khan Education Service Pakistan (AKES, P) though these initiatives remained limited to few selected areas within the region.

Post Jomtien situation in NAs

In early 1993, the Government of Pakistan embarked on a bold, new approach to implementing new modes of social intervention through out the country. This new initiative, entitled the Social Action Programme (SAP) was designed to improve and expand the governments' delivery mechanism for health, education and rural water supply. The more sector-specific objectives were to: expand access of basic education to girls, focus on primary education, select sites based on merit rather than political criteria and improve management data. As part of SAP's primary education component in NAs, the Directorate of Education (DoE) engaged village communities via the Village Organizations established and fostered by AKRSP, to assist in the establishment and operation of schools for the villages' children. During the SAP first phase, 250 of these SAP community schools were established in NAs in 1995 and it was planned to establish a total 1,000 SAP community schools throughout NAs by 1998. Later, this plan was revised and a total 534 SAP community schools were established. Under this programme the government provided each school with an endowment for financing and assigned communities' day-to-day school administration and management. This arrangement has further undergone changes and schools were provided with per child subsidy through Village Education Committees (VECs) based on the school enrolment. This partnership between government and community has been an effective method of expanding access to education. Whereas the SAP failed in many other parts of the country and "The gains from SAP have generally been marginal" (World Bank), in the Northern Areas, it has 'unusually brought education to the door steps of many poor and rural families'. In NAs it

also helped to solicit greater official commitment to social sector development. The SAP also generated rich lessons on the problems of social service delivery in remote areas like NAs and highlighted the importance of governance/institutional issues, quality and demand-side issues in education, and the *effectiveness* of public spending.

On the other hand, experiences of community participation in rural infrastructure development have further ensured success to SAP programme in which communities took an active role both in establishing as well as daily administration of these schools. With the institutionalization of gains such as VECs emphasis on education particularly for female has become one of the foremost concerns within the local communities. Parents now invest sizeable resources from limited household budgets towards education, and communities donate sizeable amounts of land, labour and financial resources to the construction of schools in their villages. Although community support for female education has traditionally been limited by social norms and beliefs, most parents in the region now eagerly acknowledge the importance of educating their daughters.

Appointment of local female teachers in majority of these community schools not only helped addressing parents' unwillingness to enroll daughters in school but also opened up new opportunities for educated individual females and their families to enhance their family income. Although according to a World Bank report 'the overall enrollment rates have stagnated during the decade of 1990s' the programme in NAs has expanded access to primary education particularly for girls (girls' enrolment reported to be increased by 37%) across the region over a record period of time by reducing the distance between school and home. Nonetheless, despite the initial enthusiasm and success, these schools are facing tremendous challenges of increasing teacher-student ratio which ultimately affect quality of education, non-sufficient physical facilities and above all sustainability. During the school visits all teacher in 6 schools (2 schools in each districts of Gilgit, Skardu and Ghanche) reported that they had not received their salaries since May 2004 as the per child subsidy has been stopped. VECs have also expressed their concern that in the absence of financial support from the government they may not able to sustain school operation and feared that teachers may not continue for long as the nominal monthly school fee collected at the school is not sufficient to meet both teacher's salary and non-salary school expenditures.

Tangible outputs and gains under SAP programme particularly in NAs are obvious though SAP has been characterized as a 'major disappointment' and its emphasis on quantitative targets has been much criticized. This latter view has justification and is visible even in its implementation in NAs. And despite its success in expanding access to basic education the issue of financial sustainability is becoming serious. Apart from clear evidences from the field the end project report of Northern Areas Education Project (NAEP), the UK government's contribution to the World Bank funded Northern Education Project (NEP) has categorically termed the sustainability an urgent priority and key issue and recommended the continuance of the per child subsidy to community schools in 2002. On the other hand, it was reported that FANA has utilized only 50% Rs. 46.666 billions released under ESR up to 30th June 2002. Similarly, lack of clear direction and prevailing uncertainty regarding the ownership of these schools can also cause serious problems for future of these schools. And if these issues remain unaddressed for long the gains so far made can easily be jeopardized

World Bank support for expanding and improving primary education

Another major initiative after SAP in the educational sector of NAs is the World Bank funded Northern Education Project (NEP). It was launched in 1997-98, under the umbrella of SAP with major objective to: increase equitable access, improve quality, strengthen institutional capacity in the Directorate of Education and to increase community participation in education.

NEP has shown tremendous achievements in improving the quantity, physical quality and gender balance of elementary schools through construction of buildings for community schools, reconstruction of dangerous school buildings for government schools, and construction of new school buildings for currently shelterless government schools. Construction of nearly 400 community schools established under SAP through communities, in which case communities provided land, was a unique and first experience Pakistan despite the fact that communities were already engaged in similar activities carried by Aga Khan Education Service, Pakistan and Aga Khan Health Service Pakistan but at a much smaller scale and over a longer period of time. The quality of construction is acceptable, although schools there are few operation problems as indicated by VEC members and teachers such as roof insulation, rainwater drainage and incomplete toilets. The rapid provision of school buildings with necessary facilities including furniture particularly for community schools has significantly facilitated access to basic education particularly for girls.

F.2: Enrolment in community schools as on December 2004

District	Schools	Enrolment		Total	Teachers		Total
		Boys	Girls		Male	Female	
NAs	540	16,155	21,026	37,181	416	645	1061
Gilgit	104	2,648	7,202	9,850	49	264	313
Skardu	118	2,751	4,249	7,000	114	74	188
Diamer	118	3,993	1,878	5,871	101	47	148
Ghizer	105	3,898	4,090	7,988	61	198	259
Ghanche	95	2,865	3,607	6,472	91	62	153

Table 2 shows district wise enrolment in community schools and number of teachers in these schools. Except for the district Diamer schools in remaining four districts have higher girls' enrolment and similarly other than district Skardu and Diamer majority of teachers in community schools in remaining districts are female.

In terms of cost, this has been proved more effective (reduced by min. 20%, ICR, World Bank 2003) than construction through NAs Public Works Department. Active involvement of local communities through VECs in construction and school management played a major role in expanding access, ensuring teachers presence and an element of accountability in over all educational management. Establishment and provision of some basic training in school

management of more than 1000 VECs/SMCs/PTAs though seems impressive, however, without access to basic resources the initial enthusiasm can fizzle out. Community empowerment requires continuous outside support and networking in order to maximize the use of resources available. Functional relationship of these voluntary bodies with education department and supervisory staff has to be defined and structured as one VEC member point out that 'AEO hardly attends VEC meetings and VEC members have to travel to education office if need arises.'

NEP took concrete steps in improving education quality in order to 'support policy changes, strategies and inter-related activities designed to improve educational quality, including: (a) changes in teacher recruitment and training; (b) curriculum and educational materials development; and (c) the development of assessment capacity. Through teacher training basic teaching needs for a huge backlog of untrained teachers and a pool of newly recruited community teachers particularly women have been met. This training has aimed at improving teaching practices rather than award certificates and credentials and consequently community teachers found these training comparatively more practical and relevant to their context 'that also helped them in improving their own qualifications'. Teachers also reported that 'this has also increased their workload and at times found themselves caught between competing household demands and professional requirements particularly with low monthly earning.' Expanded opportunities for professional and academic development have significantly encouraged young recruits particularly women to aspire for higher positions as a result all 10 community teachers interviewed were currently doing B.Ed courses through Allama Iqbal Open University which is apart from the in service opportunities now available.

Under NEP also made significant progress in curriculum and material development by 'strengthening local capacity for textbook and materials development, in order to ensure that primary education is conveyed through well designed and locally relevant textbooks and making available and using a wide variety of local learning materials in the primary classrooms. This sub-component has been successful in developing learning competencies for all subjects from Katchi through grade 5; teachers' guides for low cost teaching aides and multigrade teaching; textbooks and guides for Katchi to grade 3, and first and second English books. However, there is room for further improvement in areas like follow up and ensuring availability of cost effective textbooks. Assessment has also been strengthened and improved under this project though it will take time to determine learning impact.

Institutional capacity of Directorate of Education has been enhanced through a number of measures such as organization changes, the provision of additional staff, training and technical assistance, improve the information base for planning and management decisions. The project focused special attention to training of managers at DoE including foreign tour. However, the largest initiative under NEP is the establishment of an Education Information and Management System (EMIS). Allocation of management positions for women at all levels has also been a positive change though women particularly at supervisory level are still far and few. However, project inputs and gains made during the project period may not be sustained and can be jeopardized which included school support system through allocation of vehicles and motor cycles and frequent transfers of trained staff.

Under NEP, largest improvement has been establishment of Education Management Information systems (EMIS) that developed capacities for carrying out education data collection, analysis and dissemination in order to guide decision-making on all aspects of education sector development. Prior to the project there was no information system or even a unit at DoE responsible for information gathering. However, the presence of a functional EMIS at the DoE does not ensures timely availability of information and data for decision making unless decentralized, linked to the monitoring and evaluation and involvement of staff at all level.

Additional financial support to 543 eligible community schools under the NEP via a monthly per child subsidy of Rs. 60 has enabled schools to pay teachers' salaries, purchase school supplies and learning materials, and carry out on-going facilities maintenance. However, as mentioned earlier the since May 2004, as reported by teachers and VEC member, the DoE has not paid per child subsidy. This issue alone can be a potential threat to functioning of these schools and as result future of a large number of students enrolled in these schools can be at the stake.

Summary of recent changes in the country

- **Government policies and capacity related to primary,**
- **Delivery of education services,**
- **Household demand for education, and**
- **Primary Education outputs and outcomes.**

Over years and as a result of development interventions in education sector in particular and social sector in general a positive change can be witnessed. Foremost, the current government policies in NAs are comparatively more responsive and participatory than the earlier top-down approach. Whereas, government policies are becoming more efficient and effective the capacity at the NA s level remains problematic given its embeddedness in traditional bureaucratic history. Specifically, in the past to improve access to education school building along with its fixed designed was considered to be a prerequisite, yet SAP experience proved otherwise and there is an appreciation at the government's policy and decision making level. In the past this approach has never allow education managers to have adequate resources at hand to ensure operations. During late 80s, a number of community based organizations invested considerable amounts of resources in construction of school buildings (community based English Medium Schools in Hunza and in other towns of NAs) at the cost of trained teachers, teaching materials and school management systems. Ultimately, these schools today are confronting with challenges of sustainability and quality. Given these experiences, government policies are gradually becoming sensitive to location and social context. This realization has implications on the services delivery as well. The increasing demand for education particularly for a quality education at the household level has further brought delivery system under secrutiny for improved performance and better outputs. But despite these developments primary education outputs and outcomes are far from satisfactory in NAs.

The World Bank contribution to changes in policies, capacity, services and outputs/outcomes

- **Relevance and efficacy (impact) of Bank assistance;**

- **Efficiency and sustainability of changes supported by the Bank;**
- **Counterfactual (would changes have occurred in absence of Bank support?)**

There is general consensus among primary stakeholders in education sector that the World Bank's contribution in areas of policies, capacity building, services delivery and projects outputs is significant given the abysmal history of educational development in NAs. Poor parents in remote village can have a say in fixing school timing, school holidays, monthly school fee without relocating household human resources for educating their children. Although project gains and outputs seem efficient and relevant yet it may be too early to see a long lasting impact. Changes effected as result of Bank's support require institutionalization in order to ensure sustainability. Indeed, there is always room for improvements and projects could have performed better in the past such as SAP and NEP in certain areas but the project gains such as equitable access to basic education, improvements in teaching and learning, comparative effective delivery mechanism and organizational changes would not have occurred in the absence of Bank support.

Lessons Learned from Bank assistance to primary education

- **Factors contributing to improved learning outcomes;**
- **Trade-offs between expansion and quality improvement and reasons;**
- **Relationship between WB lending instruments and ownership/effectiveness;**
- **Conditions under which decentralization is effective;**
- **Successful efforts to improve monitoring and evaluation;**
- **The political processes of policy and program formulation;**
- **Donor coordination.**

Experiences under SAP and NEP suggest that a range of factors contribute to improved learning outcomes which includes enabling physical environment, trained and professionally committed teachers, availability of relevant teaching and learning material, supportive and proactive educational management, participation of parents and political will to sustain achievements. In regions like NAs where difficult geography, ethnic and religious diversity, rigid social and cultural norms and pervasive poverty can influence daily decision making trade-offs between competing objectives is a natural outcome. For instance, all schools are close for the last four months and some government schools for the last one year due to the recent sectarian violence. Under SAP and NEP there were trade-offs; quantity was given preference particularly during SAP given the lack of trained female teachers and also absence of physical facilities, however, under NEP efforts were made to address quality. Quality also demands awareness, an effective monitoring and evaluation and ultimately localized solutions and decision making. The gradual progress towards participatory development together with decentralized mechanism can improve effectiveness of educational development initiatives.

Conclusions

- **Development effectiveness of Bank support**
- **Improving the effectiveness of future Bank support efforts**

For more than three decades since the independence in 1947, access to basic education remained an unfulfilled dream for the Northern Areas that resulted in pervasive illiteracy. Though access was a common issue across the NAs, however, situation in some areas was

worst than others. Education has received attention from early eighties onwards and since than, ‘access to education facilities particularly primary education for girls have increased in the Northern Areas (Pakistan Participatory Poverty Assessment NAs Report, 2003). One of major factors behind expanding access across the NAs was financial support received from multi-donors and the World Bank. Under SAP that aimed at providing access to girls was achieved through establishment of 540 community schools in partnership with the local communities. The gains achieved during SAP were institutionalized and strengthened under NEP through construction of over 400 school buildings for community schools apart from rehabilitation of government schools with basic facilities of toilets, drinking water, boundary walls and furniture. Teaching and learning have also improved by closely designed field-based teacher training programmes and development of locally available teaching and learning materials. At the same time, institutional capacities to plan, manage and monitor educational efforts were enhanced at various levels. Establishment of Education Management Information System (EMIS) has been a radical step for future decision making.

With improved delivery mechanism and a responsive and proactive community effectiveness of these efforts will further improve if long term strategies are developed for sustainability of outputs already achieved. International agencies such as the World Bank can play a decisive role in ensuring firm commitment and allocating resources from the government not just promises. Whereas basic infrastructure and mechanism in placed the World Bank has to bring in key stakeholders in implementation of future projects so that effectiveness can be enhanced and transparency can be ensured. Public-private partnership has be strengthened to maximize the efficiency.

Annex G. Schedule of Mission Meetings/Visits

ISLAMABAD

Mon Mar 14
Meeting in RM with with Pakistan education team (Tahseen Sayed, Ameer Naqvi and Naveed Naqvi)

Meeting with Mr. Ahmed Jawad, Senior Joint Secretary, Economic Affairs Division

Meeting with Ms. Parween Hasan, Leader for National Education Assessment System Project

Tue Mar 15
Mr. Malik Javed, Joint Secretary MOF, and Mr. Sajjad Shaikh, PRSP Secretariat

Mr. Jalil Minhas, Mr. Talib Husain, Planning and Development, Education Division

Dr. Haroona Jatoi, Joint Educational Advisor to Curriculum Wing MOE, and Dr. Fayyaz Ahmed, Joint Educational Advisor for Planning

Wed Mar 16
Prof. A. H. Nayyar, Research Associate, Susainable Development Policy Institute(SDPI), also Professor of Physics, Quaid-e-Azzam University

Ms. Shahnaz Wazir Ali, Director Pakistan Center for Philanthropy, former Minister of Federal Education.

Donors Group Meeting at Resident Mission

18:30 Mission Flight to Lahore.

PUNJAB
Thu Mar 17
Mr. Suleman Ghani, Chairman Planning and Development Board and Mr. Javed Aslam, Secretary for Education

Mr. Ahmad Raza Sarwar, Deputy Secretary, Department of Finance, Punjab

Mr. Shahid Kardar, independent consultant, former Secretary of Finance,

Fri Mar 18
First day of school visits. 2 schools visited. Reading and maths rapid assessment.

Mr. Khalid Gillani, Program Director, Program Monitoring and Implementation Unit, Punjab Education Sector Reform Program

Sat Mar 19
More school visits. Outside Lahore in Kasur District.

Sun Mar 20
11:00 am Mission meeting.
(Afternoon. Manisha, Safiullah depart Lahore for Karachi).

Mon Mar 21
(School visits attempted in Punjab. Cancelled due to weather.
Alternative meetings scheduled.)
(Manisha and Safiullah to add Karachi meetings/school visits)

Mr. Jamil Najam, Director, Public Instruction and Training

Ms. Baela Jamil, former advisor to Minister of Education, Ms.Zubaida Jalil

Mr. Tariq Sultan, retired, former Chairman, Planning and Development

Tue Mar 22
More school visits in Kasur district, smaller villages off main roads

Mr. Khushnood Lashari, Additional Chief Secretary

Ali Institute, Teacher Training Institute (private), Lahore

Wed. Mar. 23
(NATIONAL HOLIDAY-Pakistan Day)
MB depart Lahore to Karachi. FZ remain Lahore for meetings, more school visits, start write up.

SINDH
Thu. Mar. 24
Mr. Ghulam Kerro, Additional Chief Education Secretary, MOE and Mr. Hashim Legari, Secretary for Education

School Visit, outskirts of Karachi

Prof. Anita Ghulam Ali, Direcctor, Sindh Education Foundation;

Fri Mar 25
(Provincial holiday. Meetings at private institutes.)
Institute for Education Development (IED) at the Ahgha Khan Univerisity.

Mr. Wasif Rizvi and colleagues at Agha Khan Education Services.

Sat Mar 26
School visits completed. 5 schools done with reading and math assessments.

Mission meeting.

Sun Mar 27
No meetings planned. Safiullah and Manisha depart.

Mon Mar 28
Dr. Mahbub Ali Shaikh, Additonal Secretary, Academics and Training

Prof. Muhammad Soomro, Director, Sindh Education Management and Information System (SEMIS)

Tue Mar 29
Mr. Haji Sher Muhammed Soomro, Director, Planning and Monitoring Cell, Department of Education.

Mr. Waqar Ayub, Provincial Manager, Education Sector Reform Assistance (ESRA) Program of USAID.

Wed. Mar 30
Mr. Hashim Legari, Secretary for Education

Prof. Muhammad Soomro, SEMIS, follow up meeting.

Maurice depart Karachi for return to Islamabad.

ISLAMABAD
Thu. Mar. 31
Mr. Ameer Naqvi, Senior Education Specialist, Bank RM.

Mr. Asif Ali, Ms. Uzma Sadaf, Mr. Hassan Mirja. Procurement Team at RM.

Dr. Sarah Wright, USAID, Director for ESRA Program

Mr. Riaz Mahmoud, Financial Analyst, Disbursement and Financial Management Issues.

Fri. April 1
Prof. Pervez Hoodbhoy, Department of Physics, Quaid-e-Azam University, editor and author on education in Pakistan.

Mr. Hanid Mukhtar, Senior Economist, Bank RM

Mr. Naveed Naqvi, Education Specialist, Bank RM.

Mr. Abid Hasan, Operations Adviser, Deputy Director Bank RM.

Mr. Sarfaz Bhatti, Social Sector Officer. Asian Development Bank.

Mr. Ismaila Cessay, Team Leader-Financial Management, Bank Resident Mission.

wb177188

C:\DOCUME~1\wb177188\LOCALS~1\Temp\notes86F136\Formatted Case Study 2.20.doc

02/21/2007 12:07:00 PM